

MINUTES BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION Meeting of November 18, 2008

A Meeting of the Beloit Landmarks Commission was held on Tuesday, November 18, 2008 in the City Hall Forum.

Present: Daniel Shea, John Dummer, Sandra Williams, Marjorie Fizzell, Rick McGrath, Jennifer

Knezel, Charles Haynes

Absent: Lynette Johnson

1. Roll Call

Commissioner Fizzell called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM. Community Planner Drew Pennington called the Roll.

2. Minutes of the October 21, 2008 Meeting

Minutes of the October 21, 2008 meeting were approved on a motion by Commissioner Williams, seconded by Commissioner Dummer. The motion carried.

3. Public Comments

None

4. <u>Ann Reinert – Certificate of Appropriateness</u>

COA-2008-31 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace two porch columns with a pillar and to add a second set of steps to the porch on the house located at 861 Bluff Street.

Mr. Pennington read the staff report.

Commissioner Fizzell invited the applicant to the lectern. Val Annis stated the she and her husband would be speaking on behalf of the applicant. Ms. Annis stated that the second set of steps would be used by the applicant to let her dog outside. Ms. Annis stated that the steps could be removed in the future and that a second entrance to the house would not be added. Commissioner McGrath asked Ms. Annis if the existing concrete steps can be removed. Mr. Annis replied that the steps consist of poured cement and can not be (easily) removed. Commissioner McGrath asked Ms. Annis if the applicant intends to construct a sidewalk from the base of the proposed steps to the driveway. Ms. Annis replied that the applicant does not intend to construct a sidewalk. Commissioner McGrath expressed his concern about the mud that could develop at the base of the steps. Commissioner Williams asked Ms. Annis if she objected to staff's recommendation (to deny the request for a second set of steps). Ms. Annis stated that she did object to staff's recommendation. Ms. Annis stated that the porch would retain only one entrance into the house. Commissioner Fizzell asked Mr. Annis what material had been used for the porch. Mr. Annis replied that he had

used treated wood. Commissioner McGrath expressed his reluctance to approve the project without a sidewalk at the base of the steps. Commissioner Williams inquired about approving the request with the understanding that the steps would be removed when the property is sold. Mr. Pennington stated that conditioning the approval upon ownership was legally precarious and should be avoided. Commissioner Williams stated her belief that the Commission should help the applicant by approving her request for the second set of steps.

Following this discussion, Commissioner Williams made a motion to approve the requested COA (including the second set of steps), subject to the conditions recommended by staff. Commissioner McGrath seconded the motion. The motion carried (4-1), with Commissioner McGrath opposed.

5. Consideration of an Ordinance to Amend Sections 32.06(1), 32.09(1), 32.12(5)(a), 32.13 and 32.20(1) of the Code of General Ordinances of the City of Beloit Pertaining to Historic Preservation.

Mr. Pennington stated that the City Attorney's Office had reviewed the proposed Ordinance and recommended leaving Section 32.20 unchanged because the proposed change would actually reduce the Commission's discretion in situations where high-quality work is completed without a COA. Commissioner McGrath expressed his agreement with this recommendation. Councilor Haynes inquired about retaining the proposed change and adding some additional language to provide flexibility. Mr. Pennington suggested adding the phrase "unless authorized by the Landmarks Commission" to the end of Section 32.20. Mr. Pennington asked the Commission if they wanted to present the proposed Ordinance to the public in some fashion. Commissioner McGrath stated that he would present the Ordinance to his neighborhood group (NESNA).

Following this discussion, Commissioner Williams made a motion to approve the Ordinance (including the additional language at the end of Section 32.20). Commissioner Dummer seconded the motion. The motion carried (6-0).

6. Election of Officers

Commissioner McGrath made a motion to nominate Commissioner Fizzell for the position of Chairperson. Commissioner Williams seconded the motion. The motion carried (6-0).

Commissioner Dummer made a motion to nominate Commissioner McGrath for the position of Vice-Chairperson. Commissioner Williams seconded the motion. The motion carried (6-0).

- 7. Report on Staff-Approved Certificates of Appropriateness Since Last Meeting Mr. Pennington read a list of staff-approved projects that included the following:
 - <u>COA-2008-32 107 Merrill Street:</u> This project involves the repair of the rear porch (pillar, floor, stairs, etc.) in response to unsafe conditions. The applicant started working without paying for the COA and has been ordered to restore the porch to its prior appearance.
 - <u>COA-2008-33 703 Park Avenue:</u> This project involves completion of the exterior siding that was authorized by COAs in 1996 and 1999.

- <u>COA-2008-35 735 Harrison Avenue:</u> This project involves soffit, fascia, and trim repair using like materials and the replacement of the front storm door.
- The owner of <u>624 Park Avenue</u> has applied for a COA to install a historic plaque. She inquired in 2007 and Commissioner Shea completed the research at that time.

8. Committee Reports

A. Awards Committee: Nothing to report.

B. Plaque Committee: Nothing to report.

C. Program/Publicity Committee: Nothing to report.

D. Cemetery Building Committee: Nothing to report.

E. Landmarks/DBA Design District Committee: Nothing to report.

Several Commissioners discussed the need to assign the newest Commissioners to a committee. Commissioner McGrath expressed his willingness to be assigned and the Commission agreed to assign Commissioner McGrath to the Program/Publicity Committee. Commissioner Williams expressed her willingness to be assigned and the Commission agreed to assign Commissioner Williams to the Cemetery Building Committee. The Commissioners agreed to revisit each committee's duties at the next meeting.

9. Adjournment

At 7:53 PM, Commissioner Williams made a motion to adjourn the meeting, and Commissioner Dummer seconded the motion. The motion carried.

Drew Pennington Community Planner