

MINUTES BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION Meeting of May 17, 2011

A Meeting of the Beloit Landmarks Commission was held on Tuesday, May 17, 2011 in the City Hall Forum.

Present: Marjorie Fizzell, Rick McGrath, Lynette Johnson, Steve Vollmer, Charles Haynes Absent: Donna Johnson, Sandra Williams

- 1. <u>Roll Call</u> Commissioner McGrath called the meeting to order at 7:14 PM. Principal Planner Drew Pennington called the Roll.
- <u>Minutes of the February 15, 2011 Meeting</u> Minutes of the February 15, 2011 meeting were approved on a motion by Commissioner Fizzell, seconded by Commissioner Lynette Johnson. The motion carried (4-0).
- 3. <u>Public Comments</u> None
- Michael Brady, on behalf of Beloit College Certificate of Appropriateness COA-2011-04 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all of the windows in the World Affairs Center building addressed as 634 College Street, which is located on the property located at 700 College Street.

Mr. Pennington read the staff report.

Michael Brady approached the lectern and identified himself as the applicant. Commissioner McGrath asked the applicant if the stained glass windows would be reinstalled within the new frame, and Mr. Brady stated that the stained glass windows would be mounted on the inside frame. Commissioner McGrath asked the applicant why he wants to replace the windows, and Mr. Brady stated that the existing windows are not operable and are inefficient. Commissioner McGrath asked the applicant if he considered window repair. Mr. Brady stated that repairing the windows while retaining one window pane would not eliminate the need for expensive and time consuming painting, while repairing the windows and adding a second pane is more expensive than replacement.

Following this discussion, Commissioner Vollmer made a motion to approve the requested COA, subject to the conditions recommended by staff. Commissioner Fizzell seconded the motion. Commissioner McGrath asked for additional discussion.

Commissioner McGrath stated that he disagrees with the Staff Report and that the windows are a significant architectural feature. Commissioner McGrath stated that the windows are

in good condition and do not need to be replaced. Commissioner McGrath announced that he is opposed to the application to replace all of the windows.

Commissioner Fizzell stated that the applicant's energy efficiency concerns should be considered, and Commissioner McGrath stated that energy efficiency claims made by window manufacturers are false. Commissioner Fizzell stated that the applicant's maintenance concerns are valid. Commissioner Vollmer stated that the proposed windows will be energy efficient while retaining the same appearance when viewed from the street.

Following this discussion, the Commissioners voted on Commissioner Vollmer's motion to approve the requested COA, subject to the conditions recommended by staff. The motion carried (3-1), with Commissioner McGrath voting in opposition.

5. <u>Report on Staff-Approved Certificates of Appropriateness & Activities Since Last Meeting</u> Mr. Pennington announced that he recently issued Certificates of Appropriateness for the following projects:

910 Emerson Street – To install a fence.

631 Bluff Street – Storm doors.

506 Emerson Street/700 College Street – To repair roof & replace gutters.

409 Broad Street – To repair/replace façade.

6. <u>Election of Officers</u>

Commissioner Fizzell made a motion to lay over this item until the June meeting, and Commissioner Lynette Johnson seconded the motion. The motion carried (4-0).

7. <u>Discussion of Committee Assignments</u> The Commissioners decided to discuss the committee assignments during the June meeting.

8. <u>Committee Reports</u>

- A. Awards & Plaque Committee: Nothing to report.
- B. Program & Publicity Committee: Commissioner McGrath announced that he will be attending the National Trust's Main Street Conference.
- C. Education Committee: Nothing to report.
- D. Outreach Committee: Commissioner Fizzell announced that she will be offering a guided tour of the College Park Historic District at 1:00 PM on Saturday, May 28, 2011. In the event of rain, the tour will be held at 1:00 PM on Sunday, May 29, 2011.
- 9. Adjournment

At 8:09 PM, Commissioner Vollmer made a motion to adjourn the meeting, and Commissioner Lynette Johnson seconded the motion. The motion carried (4-0).

Drew Pennington, Principal Planner