

CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Meeting Date: April 20, 2010

Agenda Item: 4

File Number: COA-2010-08

Applicant: Beloit College

Owner: Beloit College

Location: 905 Church Street

Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family Residential District

Existing Land Use: Student Housing

Parcel Size: 0.14 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Michael Cain, on behalf of Beloit College, has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to demolish a detached garage for the property located at 905 Church Street. The Division of Housing Services has issued orders to replace rotten wood, to paint, and to replace the roof on this garage. The applicant has indicated that the structure is no longer safe and that repairs are not feasible. Section 32.07 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to demolition of a structure within a historic district.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

Key Issues:

- Several photographs of the garage are attached to this report. As shown in the photographs, the structure is in relatively poor condition. The garage is not actively used to store vehicles.
- As shown in the photographs, this detached garage is very close to both adjoining structures.
- This property's inclusion within the historic district is due to the house's architectural and historical significance. During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house (built in 1893) was characterized as a "pivotal" member of the Near East Side/College Park Historic District. The Intensive Survey Form does not mention the detached garage, which was constructed in 1930. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- **Findings of Fact:** Section 32.07(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes standards to be used in determining whether to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for any demolition. The Ordinance states that the Commission shall consider and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:
 - (a) *Whether the historic building is of such architectural or historic significance that this demolition would be detrimental to the public interest and contrary to the general welfare of the people of the City and the State.*

The historical significance of this property is due to the house. The garage was constructed thirty-seven years after the house. Demolishing the garage will not be detrimental to the public interest nor contrary to the general welfare.

- (b) *Whether an historic building which has not been designated as an historic landmark, contributes to the distinctive architectural or historic character of the historic district as a whole and, therefore, should be preserved for the benefit of the people of the City and the State.*

The garage does not contribute to the character of the historic district as a whole.

- (c) *Whether demolition of the historic building would be contrary to the purpose and intent of this chapter as set forth in section 32.01 and to the objective of the historic preservation plan for the applicable district as adopted by the City Council.*

Demolition of the garage will not be contrary to the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, as the garage does not represent or reflect important elements of the City's history.

- (d) *Whether the historic building is of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and/or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.*

The garage could be reproduced with relative ease and at a reasonable cost.

- (e) *Whether retention of the historic building would promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.*

Retention of the garage would not encourage or contribute to the study of American history, culture, and/or heritage.

- (f) *Whether any hardship or difficulty claimed by the owner is self-created or the result of the owner's failure to maintain the property in good repair.*

There are outstanding property maintenance orders on this property. Therefore, one could argue that the hardship claimed by the property owner is self-created.

- (g) *Whether any new structure proposed to be constructed or any change in use proposed to be made is compatible with nearby historic buildings or the historic district in which the subject property is located.*

The use of the house will remain unchanged.

Sustainability: (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels – N/A
- Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature – N/A
- Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems – N/A
- Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently – N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends **approval** of a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish a detached garage for the property located at 905 Church Street, based on the above Findings of Fact and subject to the following conditions:

1. Following demolition, the ground shall be leveled and restored to grass.
2. All work shall be completed by October 1, 2010.
3. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
4. The applicant must obtain all necessary building and/or demolition permits. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photographs, Application, and Intensive Survey Form.





CITY of BELOIT

NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: COA-2010-08

1. Address of property: 905 Church Street

2. Parcel #: 13680040

3. Owner of record: Beloit College Phone: 363-2200

700 College St Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

4. Applicant's Name: Michael Cain / Beloit College

700 College St Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

363-2200 1 751-2235 1 Cainm@beloit.edu
(Office Phone #) (Cell Phone #) (E-mail Address)

5. Present use of property: student house

6. The following action is requested:

Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)

Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)

Roof repair/replacement

Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles

Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation

Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)

Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design

Installation of fences

Storm window/storm door repair or replacement

Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

Demolition of deteriorating single car garage.
The city has cited Beloit College for rotten wood,
painting and the roof on this garage. We feel
the building is unsafe and not feasible to repair.

8. Attachments:

- Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
- Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
- Exterior photos
- Specifications (materials) for the project
- Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
- Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
- Cost estimates for all the proposed work
- Other (please explain): _____

9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:

- NHS City of Beloit SHSW Federal

NOTE:


The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).

Michael E. Cain / Michael E. Cain / 3-24-10
(Signature of applicant) (Print name) (Date)

Review fee: \$45.00 / \$25.00 if staff approved Amount paid: \$ 45.00
Scheduled meeting date: April 20, 2010
Application accepted by: D. Pennington Date: 3/30/2010

INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

City, Village or Town: BELOIT		County: ROCK		Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung		Date: July, 1981	
Street Address: 905 Church				Legal Description: L. 16, B. 24, Original Plat		Acreage:	
Current Name & Use: Residence				Current Owner: Alan A. Russell			
Film Roll No. RO-85 *RO-111				Current Owner's Address: Same			
Negative No. 14, 15 *24				Special Features Not Visible In Photographs:			
Facade Orient. W				Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No			
2 Original Name & Use:		Source	Previous Owners	Dates	Uses	Source	Town
Dates of Construction / Alteration 1893		Source A					
Architect and/or Builder:		Source					
3 Architectural Significance		4 Historical Significance		Section			
<input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input checked="" type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input type="radio"/> None		<input type="radio"/> Assoc. with lives of significant persons <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with significant historical events <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with development of a locality <input checked="" type="radio"/> Other: <u>Assoc. with the development of Beloit College</u> <input type="radio"/> None					
Architectural Statement: Although small in scale, this two story plus attic frame house combines elements of the Queen Anne, Shingle and early Colonial Revival styles in a distinctive and individual melange. Simulating the quieter massing of the Shingle style, the house is dominated by the steeply pitched gable roof which sweeps to the first story providing cover for a recessed entry, with eaves that project slightly beyond the first story walls. The massive gable is covered in shingle siding and ornamented with (over)		Historical Statement: This house was built in 1893 (A) by Professor Louis E. Holden, member of the Beloit College Department of Oratory. Holden graduated from Beloit College in 1888 and went on to Princeton Theological Seminary. His talents were well thought of and in 1889, the College president asked Holden to return for the summers and work as financial secretary at the college. (over)					
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above)		6 Representation in Previous Surveys					
A Beloit Tax Rolls, RCHS Archives		<input checked="" type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other:					
B Eaton, <u>Historical Sketches of Beloit College</u>		7 Condition <input checked="" type="radio"/> excellent <input type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins					
C Brown, William Fiske, <u>Past Made Present</u>		8 District: <u>Near East Side Historic Dist.</u> <input checked="" type="radio"/> pivotal <input type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: <u>R</u> date: <u>8/1/81</u>					
D		9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: <u>R</u>					
E							
F							

Street Church
 Number 905
 Town
 Range
 Section
 Map Name Near East Side Historic District
 Map Code NES 85/14

905 Church Street
Architectural Statement (Continued)

paired sash windows surmounted by transoms and framed by a swan's neck pediment. Two smaller windows, one oval in shape, one round-headed, punctuate the same gable ends. The second story, which projects from the roof like massive pedimented, paired dormers, is also covered with shingles and features a bracketed, gabled roof with round-headed attic windows. The first story is sided with clapboards and unornamented except for a bay window on the south facade. The west elevation features a recessed entry with side-lights and transom with thin Ionic columns and a rusticated stone and brick chimney which rises through the gable.

Historical Statement (Continued)

He graduated from Princeton in 1891 and became a member of the Department of Oratory at Beloit College. He served in that position until 1899 when he became President of Wooster College in Ohio. He was president there until 1915. From 1920-1923, he was President of James Milliken University in Decatur, Illinois. He then returned to Beloit to become the Vice President of Beloit College. (B,C)

