

CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: April 20, 2010

Agenda Item: 7

File Number: COA-2010-12

Applicant: Sudharani Shockley

Owner: Sudharani Shockley

Location: 816 Wisconsin Avenue

Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family Residential District

Existing Land Use: Single-Family Dwelling

Parcel Size: 0.32 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Sudharani Shockley has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to reconstruct a brick porch wall, to tuckpoint the house, and to replace the front steps for the property located at 816 Wisconsin Avenue. This application is the result of a Notice of Violation and citation for alteration of a structure in a historic district without a COA. In accordance with Section 32.20(1) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, the applicant is seeking a COA to retain the unauthorized alterations.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

Key Issues:

- Timeline
 - On March 15th, a Code Enforcement inspector issued the attached Notice of Violation. The Notice orders the applicant to reconstruct the wall, to tuckpoint the entire house where needed, and to replace the front steps. The Notice also instructs the applicant to restore the structure to its original condition and to contact Planning staff before beginning any work.
 - On March 16th or 17th, the applicant contacted Planning staff regarding the brick porch wall, and Planning staff advised the applicant that a COA was not required to restore the wall to its prior appearance.
 - On March 22nd, Planning staff received a complaint regarding the mortar being used to reconstruct the wall. Staff photographed the violation (attached) and issued a Notice of Violation (also attached). The Notice of Violation specifically instructs the applicant to submit a COA application by March 29th.
 - On March 23rd or 24th, Mr. Shockley contacted Planning staff to discuss the Notice of Violation. Planning staff reiterated the need to submit a COA application to be considered by the Landmarks Commission.
 - On April 6th, Planning staff issued a citation for failure to submit a COA application and for additional alteration of a historic structure without a COA (see the attached photo).
 - A COA application was submitted on April 9th. Although the application does not mention tuckpointing or replacement of the steps, staff has added these items because they are included in the original Notice of Violation.
- As shown in the attached photos, at least two different mortar colors have been used.
- Staff has discussed this project with an experienced mason, and the mason confirmed that there are numerous problems with the reconstruction including mortar color, mortar type, and brick alignment.
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house was classified as a 'pivotal' structure within the College Park Historic District. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates the completed work against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes *Specific Review Criteria* to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application:

- (1) *Architectural Details: Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.*

The mortar that has been used to partially reconstruct the brick porch wall is not compatible with the remainder of the house.

- Section 32.06(6)(c) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Landmarks Commission may grant a COA if it determines that the proposed construction, reconstruction, or exterior alteration conforms to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for the City and district.
- Staff has recommended specific conditions of approval to ensure that the standards of Section 32.06(6)(c) are satisfied.

Sustainability: (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- **Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels** – The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were developed when walking was a primary mode of travel.
- **Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature** – N/A
- **Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems** – N/A
- **Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently** – N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends **approval** of a Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct a brick porch wall, to tuckpoint the house, and to replace the front steps for the property located at 816 Wisconsin Avenue, subject to the following conditions, which are necessary to satisfy the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance:

1. All of the bricks and mortar installed between March 15, 2010 and April 20, 2010 shall be removed.
2. The brick porch wall shall be reconstructed using the original bricks and mortar that duplicates the original mortar in strength, composition, color, texture, width, and joint profile. The same applies to the mortar to be used to tuckpoint the remainder of the house.
3. When cleaning the bricks, the applicant shall use the gentlest cleaning methods possible, such as low-pressure water and masonry detergents using natural bristle brushes. Sandblasting and the use of harsh chemicals are prohibited.
4. The replacement steps shall match the existing steps in dimensions and appearance.
5. All work shall be completed by December 31, 2010.
6. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
7. The applicant must obtain all necessary building permits. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photographs, Notice of Violation – Property Maintenance, Notice of Violation – Alteration without a COA, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.







NOTICE OF VIOLATION

CITY OF БЕЛОIT **CODE ENFORCEMENT**

Violation Number: 9837

March 15, 2010

SHOCKLEY, SUDHARANI
816 WISCONSIN AVE
BELOIT, WI 53511

RE: 816 WISCONSIN AVE
Parcel #:13670760

A recent inspection of the above referenced property revealed conditions that violate specific codes and/or ordinances of the City of Beloit.

Please be advised that upon receipt of this notice you must correct the following violation within the time period specified. Failure to correct the violation within the specified time may result in citations being issued. Citations carry penalties of not less than \$177.00 and not more than \$681.00 for each violation. I would like to avoid issuing any citations and ask for your cooperation on this matter.

CODE/ORDINANCE: 7.24(3) EXTERIOR WALLS/SURFACE

VIOLATION/CORRECTION: REPLACE THE BRICK WALL THAT HAS COLLAPSED ON THE FRONT OF THE HOUSE. REPAIR OR REPLACE THE CONCRETE SILL ON THE TOP OF THE BRICK. TUCK POINT ALL AREAS OF THE BRICK ON THE ENTIRE HOUSE WHERE THE BRICKS ARE LOOSE OR THE MORTAR LOOSE OR MISSING. ***THIS PROPERTY IS HISTORICALLY LANDMARKED AND MUST BE RESTORED TO ITS ORIGINAL CONDITION.*** CONTACT DREW PENNINGTON (364-6711) IN THE PLANNING DIVISION BEFORE BEGINNING ANY WORK.

CODE/ORDINANCE: 7.24(7)EXT STRUCTURAL SAFETY

VIOLATION/CORRECTION: REPLACE THE DETERIORATED AND BROKEN CONCRETE FRONT PORCH STAIRWAY. TUCK POINT THE LOOSE BRICK AND MISSING OR LOOSE MORTAR ON THE FRONT PORCH.

THE ABOVE VIOLATION(S) MUST BE CORRECTED BY 05/31/10.

For a complete description of the municipal code and ordinance, please visit www.ci.beloit.wi.us. A written order to correct a property maintenance code violation shall remain in effect for 24 months from the date of issuance. You may request a review of the order or may appeal the order as provided in §1.15 of the Municipal Code.



City of
BELOIT, Wisconsin
Division of Neighborhood Planning

CITY HALL • 100 STATE STREET • BELOIT, WI 53511

Office: 608/364-6700 • Fax: 608/364-6609

www.ci.beloit.wi.us

Equal Opportunity Employer

March 22, 2010

Sudharani Shockley
816 Wisconsin Avenue
Beloit, WI 53511

Re: Notice of Violation – 816 Wisconsin Avenue

Dear Property Owner:

This office has received a complaint regarding an inappropriate alteration of your historic property. As you know, your property is located within the College-Park Historic District. Section 32.06(2) of the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance states that "any alteration of designated landmarks, landmark sites, or structures within an historic district in the City shall first require a Certificate of Appropriateness." On March 15, 2010, the Division of Housing Services ordered you to repair the brick wall on the front of your porch. When we discussed this order last week, I explained that a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) is not required to restore the brick wall to its prior appearance. However, an inspection of your property has revealed that the brick wall is being repaired using mortar that is a completely different color than the mortar on the remainder of the house. In addition, the mortar has been spread on the face of the bricks, effectively changing the complexion of the bricks.

In accordance with Section 32.20(1) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, you are hereby ordered to restore the property to its appearance prior to the violation. This process begins with the submittal of a COA application (enclosed). The COA application, relevant attachments, and the review fee must be received by Monday, March 29, 2010. If a completed COA application is not received by this deadline, this office will pursue the penalties outlined in Section 32.20 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

You may request a review of this order or may appeal the order as provided in Section 1.15 of the Municipal Ordinances. I look forward to a quick resolution of this matter.

Sincerely,

Drew Pennington
Community Planner

Enclosure

c: File, Property ✓
Division of Housing Services

CITY of BELOIT

NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: COA-2010-12

1. Address of property: 816 WISCONSIN AVE

2. Parcel #: 13670760

3. Owner of record: Sudharani Shockley Phone: (608) 365-0973

816 WISCONSIN AVE BELOIT WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

4. Applicant's Name: Sudharani Shockley

816 WISCONSIN AVE BELOIT WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

(773) 715-1455 r.shockley@deloitte.com
(Office Phone #) (Cell Phone #) (E-mail Address)

5. Present use of property: owner occupied

6. The following action is requested:

Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)

Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)

Roof repair/replacement

Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles

Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation

Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)

Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design

Installation of fences

Storm window/storm door repair or replacement

Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

I am rebuilding the brick front porch. The bricks on the right side fell out. We are re-using the original bricks. However the mortar is a different color all over the house. We have used five different color mortar mixes to try and match the house, however there is no consistency there.

8. Attachments:

We conclude that the brick is the most significant feature necessary.

- Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
- Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
- Exterior photos
- Specifications (materials) for the project
- Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
- Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
- Cost estimates for all the proposed work
- Other (please explain): *I have not received any financial assistance*

9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources: *NONE*

- NHS
- City of Beloit
- SHSW
- Federal

NOTE:

The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.


If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).

Sudharani Shockley (Signature of applicant) | *Sudharani Shockley* (Print name) | *3-26-10* (Date)

Review fee: \$45.00 / \$25.00 if staff approved	Amount paid: \$ <u>45.00</u>
Scheduled meeting date: <u>April 20, 2010</u>	
Application accepted by: <u>Don Pennington</u>	Date: <u>4/9/10</u> *

**Late application accepted due to ongoing violation.*

INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

1 City, Village or Town: BELOIT	County: ROCK	Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung	Date: July, 1981	Street Wisconsin Number 816	
Street Address: 816 Wisconsin Avenue		Legal Description:	Acreage:		
Current Name & Use: Residence		Current Owner:			
Film Roll No. RO-87 *RO-111	Negative No. 11 *34	Current Owner's Address:			
Facade Orient. E			Special Features Not Visible In Photographs:		
Original Name & Use: Dr. Connell		Source	Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No		Town Range Section Map Name Near East Side Historic District
Dates of Construction /Alteration 1913		Source A	Previous Owners	Dates	
Architect and/or Builder:		Source	Uses	Source	
3 Architectural Significance <input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input checked="" type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input checked="" type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input type="radio"/> None		4 Historical Significance <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with lives of significant persons <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with significant historical events <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with development of a locality <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input checked="" type="radio"/> None			Section
Architectural Statement: An architecturally significant example of Prairie style influence in Beloit, this two story stucco house is dominated by rectangular massing, horizontal lines, and a variety of materials and textures. The ribbon windows (leaded casement on the second story, sash on the first), extended eaves, and a low retaining wall all stress the horizontal quality of the house. Wooden trim provides a highly linear decorative scheme, dividing the facade into horizontal panels and enframing the windows in horizontal bands, while heavy rafters extend beyond (over)		Historical Statement: Although built by Mrs. R. Watrous in 1913 (A), the house stood vacant until it was purchased four years later by Dr. and Mrs. Daniel Connell, a locally prominent surgeon and his wife. In the ensuing 68 years, only three families have lived there: Dr. and Mrs. Connell, Dr. and Mrs. G. W. Curless (1930-1960), and Dr. and Mrs. Walter Scholten (1960's to present). (B)			Map Name Near East Side Historic District
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above) A Beloit Tax Rolls, RCHS Archives B City Directories, 1913-1968 C D E F		6 Representation in Previous Surveys <input type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other:			Map Code NES 87/11
7 Condition <input checked="" type="radio"/> excellent <input type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins		8 District: <u>Near East Side Historic Dist.</u> <input checked="" type="radio"/> pivotal <input type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: <u>R</u> date: <u>8/1/81</u>			
9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: <u>R</u>		(This section is merged into the previous one for better readability)			

Wisconsin Avenue
Architectural Statement (Continued)

the eaves. A cross gable and two story box bay window project slightly from the east wall but are held in low relief. The pedimented brick entry and the side porch are supported by squat, battered brick piers. Both the wooden trim and the tile roof--reminiscent of the Arts and Crafts movement as well as traditional Japanese architecture--enliven the solid stucco walls and provide an eclectic element to the Prairie massing. The house has a large lot and serves as an imposing landmark along Wisconsin Avenue, anchoring the northeast corner of the Near East Side Historic District.

CITY of BELOIT
Neighborhood Planning Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 816 Wisconsin Avenue

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.		X	
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?		X	
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?			X
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?			X
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.		X	
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?			X
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?			X
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?	X		