## CITY OF BELOIT REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Meeting Date: June 21, 2011	Agenda I	t <b>em:</b> 5			File Number: COA-2011-11
Applicant: Darrell Morris	Owner: D	arrell &	Malind	a Morris	Location: 922 Bluff Street
<b>Existing Zoning:</b> R-1B, Single-Family Residential District	<b>Existing</b> Dwelling	Land	Use:	Single-Family	Parcel Size: 0.17 Acre

#### Request Overview/Background Information:

Darrell Morris has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to renovate the existing detached garage for the property located at 922 Bluff Street. Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a COA prior to the alteration of structures within a Historic District.

#### Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

#### Key Issues:

- This proposed garage renovation project involves the replacement of rotten siding and the installation of vinyl siding, replacement of three (3) windows on the first story, replacement of three (3) windows on the second story, and replacement of the side door.
- The applicant has proposed the installation of smooth finish vinyl siding that is white in color.
- The applicant has proposed the installation of single-hung vinyl windows that are white in color.
- The applicant has proposed the installation of a steel service door without windows.
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house on this property was classified as a 'contributing' structure within the Bluff Street Historic District. The Intensive Survey Form does not mention the garage. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- The applicant has not proposed any alterations to the historic house located on this property.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes Specific Review Criteria to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application:
  - (1) <u>Architectural Details</u>: Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.

The proposed materials are relatively common, contemporary materials that are readily available at home improvement stores. While they are not ideal, the proposed materials are compatible with the house and the larger historic district. Most notably, the applicant has proposed the installation of smooth finish vinyl siding.

- Section 32.06(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Landmarks Commission may grant a COA if it determines:
  - (a) In the case of a landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which the work is to be done.
  - (b) In the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would not adversely affect or would harmonize with the external appearance of other improvements on such site.
  - (c) In the case of any property located in an historic district, the proposed construction, reconstruction, or exterior alteration conforms to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for the City and district.
- Staff believes that the proposed actions, subject to certain conditions, satisfy the standards of Section 32.06(6)(c).

**Sustainability:** (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were developed when walking was a primary mode of travel.
- Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature N/A
- Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems N/A
- Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently N/A

#### Staff Recommendation:

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends <u>approval</u> of a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate the existing detached garage for the property located at 922 Bluff Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall use the materials that were described and illustrated in the application and attachments.
- 2. All work shall be completed by December 31, 2011.
- 3. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
- 4. The applicant shall obtain a Building Permit. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.

#### Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photos, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.





NEIGHBORI 100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511	
CERTIFICATE of A	APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION
(Please Type or Print) 1. Address of property: 2. Parcel #: 35808	File Number: <u>CoA-2011-11</u> 22 Bluff <u>St</u> - Garage 30
3. Owner of record:	Phone: 365-5749
	(City) (State) (Zip) Darrell L. Morris Beloit Wi 5351/ (City) (State) (Zip) (State) (Z
5. Present use of property:	hame
6. The following action is request	ed:
Approval of COA by Land	marks Commission (projects not listed below)
Approval of COA by staff:	
[ ] Roof repair/replaceme	
	ent with historically appropriate materials and in historically
	riveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate limensions, placement and orientation
	plaques (residential properties only)
	ckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior ically appropriate color and design
[] Installation of fences	
[] Storm window/storm of	door repair or replacement
[] Installation of glass bl	ocks in basement window openings
I	Please continue to #7 (Over)
Planning Form No. 32 Established: Novemb	er 1993 (Revised: January 2011) Page 1 of 2 Pages

### CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7.	Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.
	Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed
	work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or
A	architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)
$\bigcirc$	Carriage House with northern bottom replace rotten siding
~	+ cover entire garage with Vinyl siding.
٢	3 lower windows - replace with same size window.
	The 3 lover windows are non-existent.
. 8.	Attachments:
	[] Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
	[] Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
	[] Exterior photos
	$[ \times ]$ Specifications (materials) for the project
	[] Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
	[] Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
	[] Cost estimates for all the proposed work
	[] Other (please explain):
9.	Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the
	following sources:           [] NHS         [] City of Beloit         [] SHSW         [] Federal
Th are Ne	OTE: e Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the highborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks mmission meeting.
	you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit ighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).
Я	

Darrell J - Man	151 Oarrell L.	Morris 06-09-2011
(Signature of applicant)	(Print name)	(Date)
Review fce: \$50.00* / \$25.00* i * Review fees are doubled to \$100.00		
Scheduled meeting date:	uner 1, 2011	Date:6/10/11
		anna an
Planning Form No. 32 Established: No.	ovember/1993 (Revised: Janu	ary 2011) Page 2 of 2 Pages

(3) Entrance door on South side. -Currently not useable. Remove + replace with a suitable door.

(1) 3 upper windows - 1 is covered + a to and have glass in them. Replace with same size windows.

5 There are 3 small windows that budge we will leave in place. They are on the West side.

INTENSIVE SURVET FORM Historic Freserv I City, Village or Town: County:		Burveyor:		l	Date:		
BELOIT	an an sta S	Richard P. H	?. Hartung		July, 1	981	2
Street Address:		Legal Description: Acreage:					uff
\$ 922 Bluff			i en en el composition. Ser		na di di tang Manggana di		2.1
Current Name & Use:		Current Owner:					-
residence					4		
Film Roll No.		Current Owner's	Address:				
R0-114							
Negative No.		Special Features	Not Visible	In Phote	ographs:		
33 Prints				-6-2-6		e yn ei	922
Facade Orient.				e te pre			
, Е						a da	, ·
Original Name & Use:	Source		Interior visit	Uses	Yes (	Source	<b></b>
	Bource	Flevious owners	Dales	USCS		oour ce	
Dates of Construction /Alteration	Source					1	
c. 1900		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	·			1. 1. 1. 1.	
Architect and/or Builder:	A						
ACCALLECT AND/OF BUILDER.	Source						
Architectural Significance Represents work of a master Possesses high artistic values O Represents a type. period, or method of cons O Is a visual landmark in the area O Other: & No.		Assoc. wi	ignificance th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	
<ul> <li>ORepresents work of a master</li> <li>OPossesses high artistic values</li> <li>ORepresents a type. period, or method of cons</li> <li>OIs a visual landmark in the area</li> </ul>		Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other:	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	
<ul> <li>ORepresents work of a master</li> <li>OPossesses high artistic values</li> <li>ORepresents a type, period, or method of cons</li> <li>O Is a visual landmark in the area</li> <li>O Other:</li></ul>	one the	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	
ORepresents work of a master     OPossesses high artistic values     ORepresents a type, period, or method of cons     OIs a visual landmark in the area     Other:	one the	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	Bluff S
CRepresents work of a master Possesses high artistic values Represents a type. period, or method of cons O Is a visual landmark in the area O other:	one the mass- etain- ur-	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	Bluff S
S Represents work of a master Possesses high artistic values Represents a type. period, or method of cons O Is a visual landmark in the area Other:	the mass- etain- ur- and	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	Bluff Street
S: ORepresents work of a master Possesses high artistic values ORepresents a type. period, or method of cons Olis a visual landmark in the area Other:	one mass- etain- ur- and t	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	Bluff Street
S. ORepresents work of a master Operation of the series	one mass- etain- ur- and t	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	Bluff Street
<ul> <li>CRepresents work of a master</li> <li>Possesses high artistic values</li> <li>CRepresents a type, period, or method of cons</li> <li>O Is a visual landmark in the area</li> <li>O Other:</li> </ul>	one mass- etain- ur- and t	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	Bluff Street Historic
S Represents work of a master Possesses high artistic values Represents a type. period, or method of cons Other:	one mass- etain- ur- and t	Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Assoc. wi Other: 3 None	th lives of s th significan th developmen	t histor	rical eve	nts .	Bluff Street
S: ORepresents work of a master OPossesses high artistic values ORepresents a type. period, or method of cons OIS a visual landmark in the area Other:	one mass- etain- ur- and t	4 OAssoc. wi OAssoc. wi OAssoc. wi Other: Q None Historical S	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement:	thistor	rical eve locality —	nts .	Bluff Street Historic Distr
S: ORepresents work of a master Possesses high artistic values ORepresents a type. period, or method of cons OIS a visual landmark in the area Other:	one mass- etain- ur- and t	Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: ONone Historical S	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement:	s Survey	rical eve locality — —	nts	Bluff Street Historic
Sources of Information (Reference to Above) Represents of Information (Reference to Above)	one mass- etain- ur- and t	Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: ONone Historical S	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement:	thistor	rical eve locality — —	nts	Bluff Street Historic Distr
Sources of Information (Reference to Above) Sources of Information (Reference to Above)	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: O None</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Representation</li> <li>HABS ONAED</li> <li>Other:</li> <li>Condition</li> </ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement: tatement:	s Survey O NREP	<u>'8</u> Olanda	nts ark	Bluff Street Historic Distr
<ul> <li>Sources of Information (Reference to Above)</li> <li>Sources of Information (Reference to Above)</li> </ul>	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: O None</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Kepresentation</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Mathematical S</li> <li>Condition</li> <li>Oexcellent</li> </ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement: tatement:	s Survey O NREP	rical eve locality — —	nts ark	Bluff Street Historic District
<ul> <li>Sources of Information (Reference to Above)</li> <li>Sources of Information (Reference to Above)</li> </ul>	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: O None</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Kepresentation</li> <li>Habs ONAED</li> <li>Other:</li> <li>Condition</li> <li>Oexcellent</li> <li>District:</li> </ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement: on in Previou R Ø WIHP ( Ø good Ofa	s Survey ONRHP	<u>'s</u> Olandm	nt <b>s</b> ark <u>ruins</u>	Bluff Street Historic District BS
<ul> <li>Sources of Information (Reference to Above)</li> <li>Sources of Information (Reference to Above)</li> </ul>	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: ONone</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Kepresentation</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Massoc. vi Other:</li> <li>Condition</li> <li>Condition</li> <li>Oexcellent</li> <li>District:</li> <li>Opivotal Oc</li> </ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement: tatement: <u>on in Previou</u> R Ø WIHP ( <u>Ø good Ofa</u> contributing	s Survey ONRHP <u>ir Op</u> Onon-	rical eve locality Olandmo contribu	ark ruins	Bluff Street Historic District BS
Sources of Information (Reference to Above) Sources of Information (Reference to Above)	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: O None</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Kepresentation</li> <li>Habs ONAED</li> <li>Other:</li> <li>Condition</li> <li>Oexcellent</li> <li>District:</li> </ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement: tatement: <u>on in Previou</u> R Ø WIHP ( <u>Ø good Ofa</u> contributing	s Survey ONRHP <u>ir Op</u> Onon-	<u>'s</u> Olandm	ark ruins	Bluff Street Historic District BS
Sepresents work of a master ORepresents work of a master Orepresents a type, period, or method of coms Other:	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. vi OAssoc. vi Other: ONone</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Kepresentation</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Main of the second sec</li></ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement:	s Survey ONREP it Op Onon- date	<pre>/S Olandma contribu :: \$/./2</pre>	ark ruins	Bluff Street Historic District
<ul> <li>Sepresents work of a master</li> <li>ORepresents a type. period, or method of cons</li> <li>OREPRESENTS a type. period, or method of cons</li> <li>Other:</li></ul>	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. wi OAssoc. wi Other: ONOR</li> <li>None</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Other:</li> <li>Other:</li> <li>Condition Oexcellent</li> <li>District: Opivotal Oci</li> <li>Opinion of Ne</li> </ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement:	s Survey ONRHP <u>ir Op</u> Onon- date ter Elig	rical eve locality Olandra contribu :: <u>9 , :</u> ibility	ark ruins	Bluff Street Historic District BS
Sources of Information (Reference to Above) Sources of Information (Reference to Above) Visual estimate of surveyor	one mass- etain- ur- and t	<ul> <li>Assoc. wi OAssoc. wi Other: ONOR</li> <li>None</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Historical S</li> <li>Other:</li> <li>Other:</li> <li>Condition Oexcellent</li> <li>District: Opivotal Oci</li> <li>Opinion of Ne</li> </ul>	th lives of s th significan th developmen tatement: tatement: <u>on in Previou</u> R Ø WIHP <u>Ø good Ofa</u> contributing <u>Mational Regis</u> not eligible	s Survey o NRHP <u>ir Op</u> Onon- date ter Elig Ounk	rical eve locality Olandra contribu :: <u>9 , :</u> ibility	ark ruins ting 91	Street Historic District BS

# CITY of BELOIT

Neighborhood Planning Division100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511Phone: (608) 364-6700Fax: (608) 364-6609

#### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST**

#### For property located at: <u>922 Bluff Street</u>

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.	x		
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?	X		
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?			x
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?	X		
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.			X
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?			X
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?	x		
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?	x		