CITY OF BELOIT



REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: August 16, 2011 Agenda Item: 5 File Number: COA-2011-17

Applicant: Huffman Builders, Ltd. Owner: Christopher DeLong Location: 917 Church Street

Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family Existing Land Use: Single-Family Parcel Size: 0.21 Acre

Residential District Dwelling

Request Overview/Background Information:

Huffman Builders, Ltd. has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to replace a portion of the roof, to replace the dormer siding, to repair the soffit & fascia, and to replace two columns for the property located at 917 Church Street. The subject property is located in the College Park Historic District. Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a COA prior to the alteration of structures within a Historic District.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

Key Issues:

- Several photographs of the subject property are attached to this report.
- According to the applicant, the roof is missing 10-20 shingles that will be replaced using shingles that match the remainder of the roof.
- The applicant has proposed the replacement of the siding on the rear dormer using wood shingle siding that is identical
 to the existing siding.
- The applicant has also proposed the repair of the soffit & fascia using materials that match the existing materials.
- This house includes a portico with two columns. According to the applicant, the base of both columns has rotted. The applicant has proposed the use of aluminum replacement columns.
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house was classified as a 'contributing' structure within the College Park Historic District. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes Specific Review Criteria to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application:
 - (1) <u>Architectural Details</u>: Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.

With the exception of the aluminum replacement columns, the applicant has proposed the use of materials that are compatible with the original style and character of the house. The applicant has indicated that it is possible to repair the existing columns, which would preserve the integrity of the front façade.

- Section 32.06(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Landmarks Commission may grant a COA if it determines:
 - (a) In the case of a landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which the work is to be done.
 - (b) In the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would not adversely affect or would harmonize with the external appearance of other improvements on such site.
 - (c) In the case of any property located in an historic district, the proposed construction, reconstruction, or exterior alteration conforms to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for the City and district.

Sustainability: (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces
 dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic
 districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were developed when walking was a primary mode of travel.
- Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature N/A
- Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems N/A
- Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends <u>approval</u> of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a portion of the roof, to replace the dormer siding, and to repair the soffit & fascia for the property located at 917 Church Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall use the materials that are described in the application.
- 2. All work shall be completed by June 1, 2012.
- 3. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
- 4. The applicant shall obtain a Building Permit before beginning any work. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends <u>denial</u> of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace two columns for the property located at 917 Church Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photographs, Column Specifications, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.







CITY of BELOIT

NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

| | A TOTAL CONTRACTOR OF THE CONT |
|---|--|
| (Please Type or Print) | File Number: COA-ZOU-17 |
| 1. Address of property: | Church Street |
| 2. Parcel #: \\\\ \\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\ | |
| 3. Owner of record: Mr. Chris Dela | ong Phone: |
| 917 Church Beloit | WI 53511_ |
| (Address) (City) | (State) (Zip) |
| 4. Applicant's Name: Huffman B | uilders Ltd. |
| 2442 Murphy Wds Beloit | WI 53511 |
| (Address) (City) | (State) (Zip) |
| 608-362-9263 11-608-751 | |
| (Office Phone #) (Cell Phone #) | (E-mail Address) |
| 5. Present use of property: Residence | |
| | |
| 6. The following action is requested: | |
| ☐ Approval of COA by Landmarks Commis | sion (projects <u>not</u> listed below) |
| ☐ Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that a | apply) |
| [Roof repair/replacement | |
| Gutter repair/replacement with historical appropriate styles | cally appropriate materials and in historically |
| Private sidewalk and driveway repair/n materials in the same dimensions, plac | replacement with historically appropriate tement and orientation |
| [] Installation of historic plaques (resider | ntial properties only) |
| Chimney repair and tuckpointing according standards and in historically appropriate | |
| [] Installation of fences | |
| Storm window/storm door repair or re | placement |

Please continue to #7 (Over)

___ Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Planning Form No. 32

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

| 7. | Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately. |
|-------|---|
| | Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed |
| | work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or |
| | architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.) |
| | Repair approximately 20 shingles on roof (same as existing) |
| | Replace dormer siding (same as existing) bood stigle |
| | Repair-Soffitt and facia (Same as existing) |
| | Replace Two front post (Looks the same as existing) 700 |
| 8. | Owner to paint soffitt and windows -) can be repaired |
| ٠. | Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.) |
| | Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos |
| | [] Exterior photos |
| | Specifications (materials) for the project |
| | Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases) |
| | Inspection report (required for demolition requests only) |
| | Cost estimates for all the proposed work |
| | Other (please explain): Value of repairs \$ 6377 |
| 9, | Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the |
| | following sources: [] NHS |
| NC | OTE: |
| | e Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings |
| | held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the |
| | ighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks mmission meeting. |
| | you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit |
| | ghborhood Planning Division (364-6700). |
| | |
| | 1 Alva E. Huffmen 1 7-25-11 |
| | (Signature of applicant) (Print name) (Date) |
| Rev | view fee: \$50.00* / \$25.00* if staff approved Amount paid: \$ 50.00 \$ 50.00 eview fees are doubled to \$100.00 and \$50.00, respectively, when work begins prior to issuance of a COA. |
| | reduled meeting date: Avanst 16, 2011 |
| | plication accepted by: Properties Date: 7/25/1 |
| | |
| Planr | ing Form No. 32 Established: November 1993 (Revised: January 2011) Page 2 of 2 Pages |

| | oric Preserva | tion D | · | e Historio | al Soc | | Wiscons | sin |
|--|-----------------------------|----------|-----------------------------------|---------------|--------------|---------------------|---------|----------------------------------|
| City, Village or Town: | County: | | Surveyor: | |] | Date: | | 요! |
| BELOIT | ROCK | | Richard P. H Legal Description | | | July, | | Church |
| Street Address: | | | Legal Description | on: | | Acreage: | | 3 |
| 917 Church | | | | | | | | |
| Current Name & Use: | | | Current Owner: | | | | | |
| residence | | | | | | | | 1 |
| Film Roll No. | | | Current Owner's | Address: | | | | |
| R0-116 | | | | | | | | |
| Negative No. | rints | | Special Features | Not Visible | In Phot | ographs: | - | 1 ; |
| 8 37 4 | rints | | | | | •// | | 917 |
| Facade Orient. | É | | | | | | | , |
| W +8 -94 | FILEN | | ļ. , | Interior visi | ited? (| Yes (| Оио | |
| Original Name & Use: | | Source | | Dates | Uses | <u> </u> | Source | - |
| 2 | | | | | | | | Ę |
| Dates of Construction /Alteration | 1 | Source | | | | | + | |
| c. 1925 | | А | 1 20 52 | | | - | ++ | |
| Architect and/or Builder: | | Source | | | - | | | vange |
| 4 . | | | | <u> </u> | | | - | Ġ |
| Architectural Significance | | <u> </u> | Historical S | lanificana | 1 | | | |
| Represents work of a master O Possesses high artistic value O Represents a type, period, or O Is a visual landmark in the a Other: | method of const | | Assoc. wi | | nt histo | rical eve | | uotioac |
| Architectural Statement: | | | Historical S | tatement: | | | | Nea |
| A Georgian Revival brick hous central pavilion, hipped roo rafters and classical portico columns and full entablature. | f with extend with Doric | | | | 1.42 | | | Near East Side Historic District |
| 5 Sources of Information (Reference | to Above) | | 6 Representati | _ | | | . | ict |
| A Visual estimate of survey | or | | O HABS O NAE | R ⊗WIHP | ONRHP | O lands | ual K | |
| | | | 7 Condition | | | _ | | |
| В | | | © excellent | | | | | |
| <u>C</u> | | | 8 District: N | | Onon | storic -contribu | - 1 | NES NES |
| | | | | | | . 1 | , 1 | ŏ |
| D | | | initials: | <u> </u> | | e: <u>81</u> 1 | | 116/ |
| D E | | | initials: 9 Opinion of N | <u> </u> | ster Eli | gibility | | Map Code NES 116/8 |

CITY of BELOIT

Neighborhood Planning Division
100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 917 Church Street

| GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA | YES | NO | N/A |
|--|----------|--------------|----------|
| Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use | | | |
| for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its | | | X |
| originally intended purpose? | | | |
| Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character | v | v | |
| of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be | X | X | |
| avoided when possible. | | | |
| Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, | X | X | |
| rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance? | 2 | 21 | |
| Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the | | | |
| development of a building over time that may have acquired | | | X |
| significance in their own right? | | | |
| Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic | | | |
| features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a | X | \mathbf{X} | |
| building, structure or site? | | | |
| Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated | | | |
| architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is | X | X | |
| necessary, the new material should match the material being | | | |
| replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual | | | |
| qualities. | | | |
| Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods | | | X |
| that will damage the surface of the historic building? | | | X |
| Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project? | | | A |
| If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, | | | |
| does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural | | | X |
| material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, | | | A |
| material and character of the property and neighborhood? | | | |
| Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner | | | |
| that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, | X | X | |
| the essential form and integrity of the building would be | | | |
| unimpaired? | | | |