

CITY OF BELOIT REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: April 17, 2012	Agenda Item: 4	File Number: COA-2012-08
Applicant: Glen H. Mccaulen	Owner: Glen H. Mccaulen	Location: 204 Bluff Street
Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family Residential District	Existing Land Use: Single-Family Dwelling	Parcel Size: 0.24 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Glen Mccaulen has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to renovate the front porch and balcony, install new staircases on both sides of the front porch, install new vinyl siding, and install new sidewalks for the property located at 204 Bluff Street. Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a COA prior to the alteration of structures within a Historic District.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

Key Issues:

- The subject property is on a corner lot at the intersection of Bluff Street and Kenwood Avenue.
- The applicant has proposed to renovate the front porch and balcony, siding on the sides of the house, and sidewalks on the property. The renovation will occur in the following manner:
 - 1. Removal of siding and both sets of porch staircases to expose the porch framework and supports.
 - 2. Removal and replacement of damaged supports. The newly installed supports will be leveled with stacking cement piling block.
 - 3. The porch frame will be refaced with plywood in order to install Ovation Triple 3" vinyl siding that is Victorian Grey in color with a smooth finish. A new porch ledge will be installed and painted.
 - 4. Two sets of staircases will be installed on the north and south ends of the porch. The staircases will be constructed of pressured treated wood. 2" by 2" Colonial spindles and 4" by 4" Turned deck posts are proposed for both sets of staircases (see attached photos). Handrails for both sets of staircases will be 34 inches in height.
 - 5. The second story balcony will be renocated by removing rotten wood and existing siding and replacing it with the pressure treated wood and Ovation Triple 3" vinyl siding.
 - 6. Deteriorated siding on the north, south and rear sides of the house will be removed and replaced with acceptable siding salvaged from the remnants left over from the porch.
 - 7. Existing sidewalk paths on the south and west sides of the property will be removed and paved with concrete (see attached sketch).
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house on this property was classified as a 'contributing' structure within the Bluff Street Historic District. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes Specific Review Criteria to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application:

(1) Landscaping:

a.Compatibility. Landscaping should first be compatible with the architectural character and appearance of the landmark itself and then, if necessary, with other surrounding structures and landscapes in the historic district.

b. Classification. (Am. #2862) Landscaping shall be classified as hardscape or softscape. Hardscape is any item which is permanently fixed, installed, mounted or erected on historic property and which enhances the appearance or value of the property. Hardscape includes, but is not limited to, driveways, fences and gazebos. Softscape is any removable display, structure and any item which grows through the natural photosynthetic

process. Softscape includes, but is not limited to, plants, grasses, bushes, shrubs, seasonal plantings and trees less than 12 inches in diameter, playground equipment, flagpoles and lawn statuary. *c. Hardscape Review*. (Am. #2862)

- 1) Commission Review. The Commission shall review and approve the installation and removal of hardscape in front and corner side yards.
- 2) Planning Director. The Planning Director shall review and approve installation or removal of certain hardscape materials (private driveways and sidewalks) in rear or side yards.
- 3) Appeal. Any property owner aggrieved by a hardscape decision of the Planning Director may appeal the decision to the Commission.
- 4) Softscape Review. Neither the Commission nor the Planning Director shall review the installation or removal of softscape.

The proposed concrete material, concrete finish and layout is compatible with the character and appearance of the landmark site.

(2) <u>Architectural Details</u>: Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.

The proposed materials, colors and textures are compatible with the house and the Bluff Historic District.

- Section 32.06(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Landmarks Commission may grant a COA if it determines:
 - (a) In the case of a landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which the work is to be done.
 - (b) In the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would not adversely affect or would harmonize with the external appearance of other improvements on such site.
 - (c) In the case of any property located in an historic district, the proposed construction, reconstruction, or exterior alteration conforms to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for the City and district.
- Staff believes that the proposed actions, subject to certain conditions, satisfy the standards of Section 32.06(6).

Sustainability: (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces
 dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic
 districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were developed when walking was a primary mode of travel.
- Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature N/A
- Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems N/A
- Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Planning and Building Services Division recommends **approval** of a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate the front porch and balcony, install new staircases on both sides of the front porch, install new Ovation Triple 3" vinyl siding that is Victorian Grey in color with a smooth finish, and install new sidewalks for the property located at 204 Bluff Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall use the materials that were described and illustrated in the application and attachments.
- 2. All work shall be done in a workmanlike manner.
- 3. All work shall be completed by August 31, 2012.
- 4. The applicant shall obtain a Building Permit prior to starting any work. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Community and Housing Services Division.
- 5. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photos, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.

Photographs of 204 Bluff Street



CITY of BELOIT
NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION
Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (808) 304-0005
CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION
(Please Type or Print) 1. Address of property: <u>204</u> Bluff St. Beloit, WE 53511
1. Address of property: 204 Blut+ Sr. Delori, we read
2. Parcel #: 15550460 3. Owner of record: <u>Glen H. McCauley</u> Phone: <u>(08-365-304)</u> 5351
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)
4. Applicant's Name: Glen H. McCauley
4. Applicant's Name: <u>Gren H: Micturate</u> <u>W1</u> <u>S3S11</u> <u>3335 PowWow Trail Beloit</u> , <u>(State)</u> <u>(Zip)</u> (Address) <u>(City)</u> <u>(City)</u> <u>(State)</u> <u>(Zip)</u> <u>(Address)</u> <u>(City)</u>
5. Present use of property: <u>Residential Rental Property</u>
6. The following action is requested:
Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)
Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)
r) D . Commin/remlagement
Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically
 Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement and orientation
Langtallation of historic plagues (residential properties only)
 Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design
Installation of fences

- Storm window/storm door repair or replacement
- [___] Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

.

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

	See picture dated 10/110/2009
	1- Front porch 7
	2 - Upper balcony porch See description in proposal
	3a/3b- Porch Stairways) from Action Construction
8.	<u>J- Upper balcony porch</u> See description in proposal <u>Ja/3h- Porch Stairways</u> from Action Construction <u>H- Sidewalk & stairway</u> ad replace - <u>see proposal from</u> <u>Attachments:</u>
	$[\chi]$ Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
	[] Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
	[X] Exterior photos
	[] Specifications (materials) for the project
	Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
	[] Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
	$[\times]$ Cost estimates for all the proposed work
	Other (please explain):
9.	Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources: <i>NO</i>
	NHS City of Beloit SHSW Federal
BYC	

NOTE:

The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).

Signature of applicant)	<u>IGlen H. McCa</u> (Print name)	uley 1	3 26 12 (Date)
Review fee: <u>\$50.00* / \$25.00* if standard</u> * Review fees are doubled to \$100.00 and	taff approved Amount \$50.00, respectively, when wo	paid: \$ prk begins prior	to issuance of a COA.
Scheduled meeting date:			
Application accepted by: Michael	1 D. Lotton I	Date: Mor	rch 29,2012

PROPOSAL

Date: March 12th, 2012

Action Construction

Chris Bue 608-295-3610

Proposal Submitted to: Glen McCauley	Job Name: Jack-level, Restore, & Re-side Porch.			
Address: 204 Bluff St. Beloit, WI 53511	Job Location: Same			
Phone # 608-751-5184 Fax	# E-mail:			

We hereby submit specifications and estimates for: Repair house porches & new stairways at 204 Bluff St.

A - Tear off old porch siding, Stairs and rotted.

- B Inspect all porch frameworks and remove all damaged supports.
- C Jack up, level and replace any damaged supports, using stacking cement piling block under support posts.
- D Replace outer plywood decking to accept new triple 3-vinyl siding to match the homes color as close as possible.
- E Replace damaged porch ledge around whole porch, prime & paint.
- G –Install two stairways and hand rails with all new materials using wood turned spindles to keep the integrity of a Victorian age look.
- H Patch the siding around the house using the better-used siding from porch tear off & caulk where needed.
- I Repair and dress up the upper balcony porch that is above the main porch.
- J Clean up and hauling provided by Action Construction.

Note: Homeowner is to buy all materials.

State of Wisconsin dwelling contractors license # 1080675. (Action Construction)

We propose hereby to furnish material and labor – complete in accordance with the above specifications for the sum of: \$1,600.00 One thousand six hundred and 00/100 Dollars

Any alteration or deviation from above specifications involving extra costs will be executed only upon written order, and will become an extra charge over and above the estimate. All agreements contingent upon strikes, accidents, or delays beyond our control.

Acce	ptance	of l	Pro	posal
------	--------	------	-----	-------

The above prices, specifications and conditions are satisfactory and are hereby accepted. You are authorized to do the work as specified. Payments will be made as outlined above.

Signature____

Date of acceptance:

Signature





Pete Contell PROPOSALNO. 608-295-2385 SHEET NO.

o. BluFE DATE

PROPOSAL SUBMITTED TO:	WORK TO BE PERFORMED AT:
NAME Clean Mc sulling	ADDRESS
ADDRESS 2235 POWN	U.B.W
	DATE OF PLANS
PHONE NO.	ARCHITECT
	ANONIECI
We hereby propose to furnish materials and perform the	e labor necessary for the completion of
1 A A	~ 0
tear and and	Replacese
W1 × 2' 0.0	wall Sauth Side
13' X 3' 8-0	
	with with cerb
- 14 A 1 Scole	cural with vest for Dryer
11' X 3' Sudiy	with turbagement Down
14'X 3' Sich	malle
	-
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
All material is guaranteed to be as specified, and the ab	ove work to be performed in accordance with the drawings and specifications
submitted for above work, and completed in a substantia	al workmanlike manner for the sum of Elipsen Hundred
and Separty Eight	Dallers Dollars (\$ # 1.178.20
with payments to be made as follows:	. Fr. 5
V	
Any alteration or deviation from above specifications involving extra	Respectfully submitted: Leter V, Confeel
costs will be executed only upon written order, and will become an extra charge over and above the estimate. All agreements contin-	respectivity submitted. A fact V , and y
gent upon strikes, accidents, or delays beyond our control.	Per /
	Note-this proposal may be withdrawn by us if not accepted within days
The above prices, specifications and conditions are satisfic Payments will be made as outlined above.	factory and are hereby accepted. You are authorized to do the work as specified.
	Cimphuto
	Signature

Signature ___

-8



P

D

....









PLY GEM

WWW.MASTIC.COM 800-962-6973 7610094211101/BC/SW/1209

- INTENSIVE SURVER . Historic Laresery	ation y	- Portunitador - Inc Inc.	ىرى ئە ئېچىلام، يېتىقا	LL V	itty UL I	15COD	sin
City, Village or Town: County:		Surveyor:			Date:		
BELOIT		Richard P. I			July, 1		Bluff
Street Address: 204 Bluff		Legal Descripti	on:		Acreage:		
Current Name & Use:		Current Owner:			· · · · ·		
residence	-	Carrent Dwner.	-				-
Film Roll No. *RO-100 RO-113		Current Owner's	Address:	. • '			
Negative No.		Special Features	Not Visible	In Phot	ographs:		
*19 19		-		6.			Number 204
Facade Orient.				, in the second s		,	10er 204
E KODAK SAFETY FILM SOG	2	I	Interior visit	ed? (Yes 😡	No	
Original Name & Use:	Source	Previous Owners	Dates	Uses		Source	یہ در ا
2							Town
Dates of Construction /Alteration	Source						
c. 1890	A	:					×
Architect and/or Builder:	Source						Range
3 Architectural Significance Represents work of a master Possesses high artistic values Represents a type, period, or method of const Is a visual landmark in the area Other:		🛛 🔾 Assoc. wit	ignificance th lives of si th significant th development	histor	ical event	5 5 5	Section
Architectural Statement:		Historical S	tatement:				Ма
Although now asbestos sided, this Queen A house still features a picturesque profile central turreted bay, side bay, and front veranda.					-		Map Name Bluff Street
							isto
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·							Historic Dis
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above)		A Representatio	n in Previous	Surveys	5		District
A Visual estimate of surveyor		O HABS O NAER O other:	⊗ WIHP C) NRHP	O landmar	k	Ct .
В		7 Condition) _{good} Øfai	0	oor Oru		
			uff Street			wint	. 3
C		0			contributi	ng	BS
D		initials:	`		8/118		Map Code BS 113/19
		9 Opinion of Na					3/19
E		Øeligible O					-
F		Onational O	state Oloca		initials:		
	£2				HP~02-1	-	

204 Bluff St.





 \prod

INNE

southwyst

Northeast



Map Code

Number

72.1

Ronao

Section Man Name

July. 1991

CITY of BELOIT

Planning and Building Services Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: <u>204 Bluff Street</u>

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use			
for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its			Χ
originally intended purpose?			
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character			
of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any	Χ		
historic material or distinctive architectural features should be			
avoided when possible.			
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis,	X		
rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?			
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the			
development of a building over time that may have acquired			Χ
significance in their own right?			
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features,			
or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building,	Χ		
structure or site?			
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated			
architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is	X		
necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced			
in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.			
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods			Χ
that will damage the surface of the historic building?			
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve			Χ
archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed,			
does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural	X		
material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color,			
material and character of the property and neighborhood?			
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner			
that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future,	X		
the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?			