

MINUTES
BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION
Meeting of August 18, 2014

A Meeting of the Beloit Landmarks Commission was held on Tuesday, August 18, 2014 in the Forum, City Hall.

Present: Alex Blazer, Donna Johnson, Terri Kaye, Rick McGrath, Steve Vollmer, Charles Haynes

Absent: Ruth Vater, Ellen Joyce

1. Roll Call

Commissioner Blazer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM. Planner Stephanie Hummel called the Roll.

2. Minutes of the July 15, 2014 Meeting

The Minutes of the July 15, 2014 meeting were approved on a motion by Commissioner McGrath, seconded by Commissioner Vollmer. The motion carried (5-0).

3. Public Comments: None

4. Keith Seaberg – Certificate of Appropriateness

COA- 2014-28 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for new driveway and porch repairs at 512 Bluff Street

Ms. Hummel read the staff report.

Commissioner McGrath questioned the porch replacement. Mr. Seaberg said there was severe deterioration and the new porch will be an exact replica. He also mentioned that a concrete mix with extra sand will be used to keep historic accuracy.

Commissioner McGrath raised concerns over extending the driveway from 8' to 18' feet in width. Mr. Seaberg noted that access to the rear rental unit would be increased, maneuverability for their trailer would be easier, and that the existing curve of the driveway would be replicated. Commissioner McGrath recommended only extending the driveway an additional 2'. Commissioner Haynes stated that a 2' addition of concrete would likely break off, but a 4' additional would likely hold up.

Commissioner Blazer reviewed the history of this driveway. An adjacent driveway was located where the proposed expansion site is when there was a house located on that lot. The driveway was removed upon the house being demolished, but the curb cut remains. Given the existing driveway is 8' and at minimum the old driveway on the adjacent lot was 8', a proposed driveway of 18' isn't much larger than what was historically there.

Following this discussion, Commissioner McGrath made a motion to approve the requested COA, subject to the conditions recommended by staff with an added condition that the width of the driveway not exceed 12'. With no second to the motion, it was denied.

Commissioner Blazer made a motion to approve the requested COA as written, subject to the conditions recommended by staff. Commissioner Vollmer seconded the motion. The motion carried (4-1), Commissioner McGrath opposed.

5. Angela Stellings– Certificate of Appropriateness

COA-2014-29 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for siding replacement and porch repairs at 816 Bluff Street

Ms. Hummel read the staff report.

Commissioner McGrath asked Ms. Stellings if she considered restoring the original wood siding. Ms. Stellings stated they haven't seen it, and therefore don't know the condition or cost of the project. She questioned the life of this option. Commissioner Haynes stated that a good paint job can last 15 years with proper maintenance. Commissioner McGrath noted that the proposed dutch lap siding is not cohesive with the code. Ms. Stellings had no objection to changing the style of vinyl siding. Commissioner McGrath stated he was against replacing one inappropriate material with another.

The Commission discussed whether or not they should approve the removal of the existing siding, then evaluate if the wood siding was in good enough condition to be restored. Ms. Stellings asked the Commission not to lay this over any longer due to her contractor's schedule. Commissioner Blazer also expressed his concerns with laying over this project, stating that new vinyl siding would still protect the original wood siding if a future homeowner wanted to take on the project. He noted that the COA could be approved and if the applicant finds the original wood to be restorable, they would be able to do it at their own discretion without the approval of the Commission.

Following this discussion, Commissioner Blazer made a motion to approve the requested COA, subject to the conditions recommended by staff, with an added condition that flat vinyl siding, not dutch lap siding, will be used for the project. Commissioner Johnson seconded the motion. The motion carried (4-1), Commissioner McGrath opposed.

6. Diana Updike – Certificate of Appropriateness

COA-2014-30 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for façade updates at 949 Brooks Street

Ms. Hummel read the staff report.

Commissioner McGrath asked if there is glass behind the section of façade that will be replaced. Ms. Updike said there was, but it isn't the original glass and is old sheet glass. She explained that parts of the wood have rotted and all replacements will be done to replicate what is there exactly.

Following this discussion, Commissioner Vollmer made a motion to approve the requested COA, subject to the conditions recommended by staff. Commissioner McGrath seconded the motion. The motion carried (5-0).

7. Beloit College – Certificate of Appropriateness

COA-2014-31 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for door replacements at 700 College Street, Middle College

Ms. Hummel read the staff report.

Tom Viel, representing Beloit College, stated that many spot repairs have already been done throughout the years and replacement is necessary at this point.

Following this discussion, Commissioner McGrath made a motion to approve the requested COA, subject to the conditions recommended by staff. Commissioner Vollmer seconded the motion. The motion carried (5-0).

8. Charles & Anita Williams – Certificate of Appropriateness

COA-2014-32 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for porch alterations at 911 Bushnell Street

Ms. Hummel read the staff report.

Ms. Williams asked for an extension on the deadline given on the COA due to the possible tuck-pointing taking this project into spring. Ms. Hummel stated this extension will be on their COA. Commissioner McGrath asked the applicants if they considered taking the front porch back to the original design. Ms. Williams stated they explored this option and the cost for that would be three times their budget for the project. She noted that the existing porch was added to the house in the 1950's and is significant in its own right.

Following this discussion, Commissioner McGrath made a motion to approve the requested COA, subject to the conditions recommended by staff. Commissioner Vollmer seconded the motion. The motion carried (5-0).

9. Report on Staff-Approved Certificates of Appropriateness & Activities Since Last Meeting

Ms. Hummel announced that she recently issued the following Certificates of Appropriateness:

849 Park Avenue:	Roof Replacement
736 Bluff Street:	Roof & Gutter Replacement
729 Bluff Street:	Roof Replacement

10. Update of Historic District Signage

Ms. Hummel updated the Commission concerning progress with the logo design for this project. She stated that Commissioner McGrath contacted two local designers, one who gave a price estimate of \$1,100. The other designer will be submitting their proposal soon.

Commissioner Joyce was going to contact designers at Beloit College. In her absence, an update will be given at the September meeting if necessary. Ms. Hummel confirmed with the Commission that they would still like to take the lead on collecting funds to pay for the logo design. Commission Haynes stated that once all cost proposals are received, he will speak with the City Manager to seek his approval of this.

11. Committee Reports

- A. Education & Outreach Committee: Commissioner Johnson reported that there will be no Heritage Days this year due to no one organizing the events. Because of this, the walking tours will be cancelled and no student involvement project will be initiated. It was recommended that the Commission take over organizing for this event. This will be discussed in the winter. Commissioner Johnson has also contacted the City's Parks Department about Schellenger Park and will be meeting with them in September. Commissioner Kaye reported back from the pastor's luncheon for the Bluff Street Neighborhood Association. She said it was a slow but hopeful start.
- B. Grant Writing Committee: Ms. Hummel informed the Commission that City Council approved the grant proposal for a new Intensive Survey. A notice of interest is due in September, the application due in November, and grant distributions announced in February or March.
- C. Site Visit Committee: Commissioner Vollmer stated that he, Commissioner Blazer, and Ms. Hummel visited all of the sites for the current COAs.

12. Adjournment

At 8:10 PM, Commissioner McGrath made a motion to adjourn the meeting, and Commissioner Johnson seconded the motion. The motion carried (5-0).

Stephanie Hummel, Planner