

CITY HALL • 100 STATE STREET • BELOIT, WI 53511 Office: 608/364-6700 • Fax: 608/364-6609

> www.beloitwi.gov Equal Opportunity Employer

# MEETING MINUTES BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

**Tuesday, November 21, 2017, 7:00 PM**Beloit Public Library, 605 Eclipse Boulevard,
Beloit, WI 53511

# 1. Roll Call

Commissioner Blazer called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM. Commissioners Jacobsen, Gallagher, Blazer, Vater, McGrath, and Truesdale were present. Councilor Anderson was also present.

# 2. Minutes of the October 17, 2017 Meeting

Commissioner McGrath suggested that staff amend item 5 to include the specific siding materials that were discussed. Commissioner McGrath also suggested that staff amend item 8 to include his inquiry regarding possible funding to allow commissioner attendance to the Annual Local History and Historic Preservation Conference.

Commissioner McGrath and Vater made a motion to amend the draft Minutes. Motion carried, 6-0.

#### 3. Public Comments:

Larry Hansen, resident, suggested the Landmarks Commission allow garage door replacements within historic districts get staff approval. Mr. Hansen speculated that newer homes built in district districts, such a single-family ranch style homes, should be exempt from Historic Preservation Ordinance requirements.

Commissioner Blazer advised Mr. Hansen to discuss these concerns with City staff.

# 4. Wisconsin Historical Society Presentation on the Milwaukee Road and Emerson Street Historic District Drew Pennington, Director of Planning & Building Services, explained the intent of the neighborhood kickoff meeting and provided an update on the status of the proposed historic district nomination. Mr. Pennington then introduced Joseph DeRose, Survey and Registration Historian, from the Wisconsin Historical Society.

Mr. DeRose presented a certificate from the National Parks Service in recognition of City of Beloit's active local preservation efforts as a certified municipality since 1990.

Mr. DeRose gave a presentation which outlined the purpose, criteria, and the procedures of the National Registry of Historic Places. Mr. DeRose answered public questions relating to national registry designation.

## 5. Luther Ledic, Bluff Street Investments - Certificate of Appropriateness

COA-2017-22 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the replacement of existing vinyl siding with matching materials on the apartment building located at 640 Bluff Street.

Rudy Moreno, Planner, read the staff report and recommendation.

Luther Ledic, property owner, presented a sample of siding material that he intended to place on the window bays and new enclosed stairway.

Commissioner McGrath discussed the historic preservation ordnance regarding replacement materials.

Mr. Ledic and Commissioner McGrath discussed alternative materials that would imitate the original stucco on the window bay, such as Dryvit or EFIS products.

Mr. Ledic and the commissioners discussed the rear enclosed stairway, siding materials, and the costs of stucco alternatives. Mr. Ledic clarified that he is willing cover the rear enclosed stairway and window bays with a siding material that resembles stucco.

Mr. Ledic also requested that the Landmarks Commission allow the placement of mailboxes were two first floor window openings are located, next to the front entry.

Commissioner Vater and Gallagher motioned to amend the COA to require the vinyl siding replacements to be stucco or stucco-like materials and to allow the enclosure of two first floor windows for the placement of tenant mailboxes. Motion carried, 6-0.

Commissioners Vater and Gallagher motioned to approve the COA as amended. Motion carried, 6-0.

#### 6. Kyra E. Wieland - Certificate of Appropriateness

COA-2017-30 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow exterior alterations on the detached garage located at 1009 Chapin Street.

Mr. Moreno read the staff report and recommendation.

Commissioner Vater asked for clarification on whether the garage is visible from the street. The garage was determined to be only slightly visible from the street.

Valerie Kiekhafer, property owner, and Kyra E. Wieland, neighbor, discussed the proposed exterior alterations they would like to have done to the detached garage.

Ms. Kiekhafer and Ms. Wieland explained that they would like to replace the existing wooden barn style doors with more conventional, sectional doors because they are lighter and more compatible with automatic garage door openers. Commissioner Vater asked about garage door openers for doors designed to open horizontally, such as the existing doors. Ms. Weiland explained that the existing doors are heavy and in need of repairs.

Commissioner Vater suggested making the COA to be more flexible to allow the preservation of the original doors. Ms. Kiekhafer expressed no desire to continue using the current barn style doors.

Commissioner McGrath commented on the carriage style design for proposed sectional doors.

Ms. Kiekhafer requested the landmarks commission to allow her to use white shingles rather than shingles on which the color matches the shingles on the residential structure. Commissioner McGrath clarified that the Landmarks Commission does not express opinion on the color of materials.

Commissioners Vater and McGrath motioned to approve the COA. Motion carried, 6-0.

# 7. <u>Larry Hansen - Certificate of Appropriateness</u>

COA-2017-31 Review and consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow a garage door replacement on the detached garage located at 620 Park Avenue.

Mr. Moreno read the staff report and recommendation.

Larry Hansen, on behalf of Marry Hansen, described the door replacement.

Commissioner McGrath asked Mr. Hansen if he had looked into the possibility of repairing the existing garage doors. Mr. Hansen explained that the owner had no interest in using the existing garage doors.

Commissioner McGrath suggested requiring the existing door be stored on the property for future restoration. Mr. Hansen expressed concern about not having available space on the property to store the existing garage doors.

Mr. Hansen mentioned the proposed replacement garage door is designed to give an older appearance that will be fitting to the character of the historic district.

Commissioner Vater went over the Historic Preservation Ordinance regarding replacement materials.

Commissioner Vater commented the unique architectural details on the existing garage doors.

Commissioner Truesdale suggested amending the COA to require the preservation of the existing garage doors.

Commissioner McGrath went over conditions that the Landmarks Commission have allowed in the past to make alterations reversible and to allow future homeowners the option to restore original architectural features. Commissioner McGrath described examples of preserving original features and materials while allowing the placement of conventional building materials.

Commissioner McGrath and Mr. Hansen discussed the available space and dimensions of the garage.

Commissioner Truesdale and Vater motioned to amending the COA to require the existing garage doors and hardware get stored onsite in a protective manner indoors. Motion carried, 6-0.

Commissioners McGrath and Truesdale motioned to approve the COA as amended. Motion carried, 6-0.

## 8. Report on Staff Activities Since Last Meeting

A. Report on Staff-Approved Certificates of Appropriateness

Mr. Moreno reported on staff approved COA's that were issued since the last Landmarks Commission meeting.

# 9. Committee Reports

- A. Education and Outreach Committee: Commissioner McGrath presented examples of histrionic preservation guideline booklets. Commissioner McGrath speculated on the possibility of using available funds to purchase new preservation booklets versus to the cost of updating the City's historic preservation brochures.
- B. Site Visits Committee: noneC. Grant Writing Committee: none
- D. Ad Hoc Sign Committee: none

# 10. Future Discussion Items

Commissioner McGrath requested an update on the possibility of funding to allow commissioner attendance to the next Annual Local History and Historic Preservation Conference.

# 11. Adjournment

Commissioners McGrath and Jacobsen moved to adjourn at 8:50 PM. Motion carried, 6-0.

Respectfully Submitted, Rudy Moreno, Planner II December 14, 2017