



CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: July 21, 2015

Agenda Item: 4

File Number: COA-2015-23

Applicant: Jeffery Henderson

Owner: Jeffery Henderson

Location: 816 Wisconsin Avenue

Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family Residential District

Existing Land Use: Single-Family Dwelling

Parcel Size: 0.32 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Jeffery Henderson has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to renovate the property located at 816 Wisconsin Avenue. The subject property is located in the College Park Historic District. Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a COA prior to the alteration of structures within a Historic District.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #5.

Key Issues:

- The applicant was granted a COA to renovate the home at 816 Wisconsin at the September 18, 2012 Landmarks Commission meeting.
 - The proposed renovations, some completed and some not completed, in the original 2012 COA (see attached) included the following:
 - Renovation of a brick porch wall and floor (completed with mistakes)
 - Renovation of brick on the southwest screened porch (completed with mistakes)
 - Repainting the historic house and its two chimneys (not completed)
 - Repair of a front entry door (not completed)
 - Repair or replacement of wooden windows (completed)
 - Repair of window sills (not completed)
 - Installation of storm windows (not completed)
 - Reroofing of historic house and detached garage (completed with mistakes)
 - Installation of new gutters and downspouts (not completed)
 - Repair and painting of stucco siding (not completed)
 - Repair of the chimney flue on the detached garage (not completed)
- During the course of the project the primary contractor used multiple subcontractors unbeknownst to the owner. The subcontractors made a number of mistakes during the course of the renovation to both the masonry and roof repair.
 - Improper work included failure to dress and clean the bricks and the usage of multiple colors of mortar during the restoration, resulting in a fragmented look.
- The applicant is requesting a COA in order to fix or complete previously approved projects in the 2012 COA as well as one new project:
 - Removal of concrete layer on the porch in order to reveal the original brick pattern.
 - Renovation of masonry on the front porch. Bricks on the exterior side of the porch wall that are irreparably damaged will be replaced with bricks from the interior side of the porch wall. The interior bricks will then be replaced with matching new brick of the same size and color as the original.
 - Applicant will ensure that the color of the new mortar matches the existing mortar and is uniform across the entire area.
 - The applicant will not allow subcontractors for any of the COA projects and will ensure the mortar used is consistent in color.
 - Limestone caps will be removed, cleaned, and re-laid.
 - Three brick chimneys (two on house and one on carriage house) will be ground-out and tuck-pointed using the same color mortar as the existing dark mortar.
 - Multiple window sills around the house will be removed, metal supports repaired, and sills repositioned at the appropriate angle away from the house in order to prevent water from draining into the window area

as currently occurs.

- Photographs of the various project locations are attached to this report.
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house was classified as a 'pivotal' structure within the College Park Historic District. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates the completed work against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes *Specific Review Criteria* to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application:

(1) *Proportions of Windows and Doors: The proportions and relationships between doors and windows should be compatible with the architectural style and character of the landmark, or in the case of new construction, with surrounding structures within the historic district.*

- The window sills will be repaired by removing them and installing appropriate reinforcement with metal supports. No window openings will be altered, therefore preserving the architectural style and character of the feature.

(2) *Architectural Details: Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.*

- Porch Wall and Chimney Repointing: The applicant has proposed to repoint the entire front façade of the house and three chimneys with the intent to fix the previous mistakes by strengthening loose bricks and using mortar consistent appearance with regard to color pigmentation. Existing bricks from the inside wall of the porch will be used to replace broken bricks on the outside wall. New bricks for the inside wall will exactly match the existing bricks in color, materials, and style.
- Porch Cement Removal: Cement on the porch will be carefully removed to expose the original pavers beneath. This will allow a lost historic detail to be visible again and further add original architectural style to the property.

- The proposed project meets the standards of Section 32.06(6)(b) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Sustainability:

- **Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels – N/A**
- **Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature – N/A**
- **Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems – N/A**
- **Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently – N/A**

Staff Recommendation:

The Planning and Building Services Division recommends approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to renovate the property located at 816 Wisconsin Avenue, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

1. The brick porch wall shall be reconstructed using the original bricks and mortar that duplicates the original mortar in strength, composition, color, texture, width, and joint profile. Replacement bricks of identical color and materials may be used on the inside of the porch when necessary. The same applies to the mortar to be used to repoint the remainder of the house.
2. When cleaning the bricks, the applicant shall use the gentlest cleaning methods possible, such as low-pressure water and masonry detergents using natural bristle brushes. Sandblasting and the use of harsh chemicals are prohibited.
3. All work shall be done in a workman like manner and consistent with the standards provided by the Secretary of the Interior.
4. All work shall be completed by July 21, 2015, and if more time is needed to complete the renovation, Planning Staff may grant an extension.
5. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Location Map, Application, Applicant Project Description, Intensive Survey Form, COA Checklist

CITY of BELOIT

PLANNING AND BUILDING SERVICES DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: ~~COA~~-2015-23

1. Address of property: 816 Wisconsin Avenue

2. Parcel #: 13670760 REM

3. Owner of record: Jeff Henderson Phone: 630-408-6801

816 Wisconsin Ave Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

4. Applicant's Name: SAME

(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

(Office Phone #) (Cell Phone #) (E-mail Address) jeffreyhenderson@1010.com

5. Present use of property: Single Family Home

6. The following action is requested:

Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)

Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)

Roof repair/replacement

Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles ✓

Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation

Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)

Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design

Installation of fences

Storm window/storm door repair or replacement il rect door

Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

816 Wisconsin Avenue Beloit, WI

This proposal concerns the second wave of restoration of the residence at 816 Wisconsin Ave. No structural alterations are planned. The only external change planned is the removal of the concrete layer of the porch, which will reveal the original brick pattern.



Front (east) view of residence



North side of residence



Rear (west) view of residence



South side of residence

Exterior masonry restoration

Front Porch

The curved front porch has suffered severe damage due to missing footings, allowing water to seep up from the ground level; previous poorly completed reconstruction and repairs; and from a concrete layer being added, covering the original brick pattern. Damage to one section of the layer of concrete reveals a small portion of the original brick.

The porch is to be completely restored on top of a 6 inch footing. All bricks and limestone caps are to be removed, numbered, cleaned, and then relaid down to the footing, including the paver bricks beneath the concrete. Front porch wing walls to be removed, numbered and relaid. New front steps under each wing wall to be restored. Paint removed from all brick. If exterior brick is damaged so as to mar the front façade appearance, it will be replaced with undamaged brick from the interior of the porch curve. The interior will use all matching new brick of the same size and color as the original. All new will be used on the inside of the porch only, to prevent a mottled, patchwork appearance.

All masonry and mortar to be historically significant: torpedo sand, Portland cement and hydrated lime, with color to be added to match existing mortar (dark) as needed. The entire house will be tuck-pointed with a dark mortar matching the original color to maintain a consistent appearance. The mix will be equal parts of hydrated lime to Portland cement and six parts of sand (Type N).

The previous attempt to redo the mortar on the house failed as the contractor subcontracted out the work and the different companies used different mixes for the mortar. Some of them even failed to properly dress and clean the bricks. No subcontracting will be allowed in this repair and one consistent mix of mortar is to be used.



Above can be seen two views of the front porch showing the overall deterioration of appearance and integrity.



Above left shows the portion of the front porch that was previously deconstructed and improperly reconstructed. The bricks in that section have been painted. Above right is the right side of the porch.



Above left can be seen the damaged concrete on the front steps, revealing a portion of the underlying paver bricks. Above right is a view of the internal section of the porch.



Above left is another view of the inside curve of the front porch. Above right the color of the mortar can be seen to be darker in the protected areas, having been originally colored with coal dust.

Other Exterior Masonry

Sills are to be removed, cleaned and restored around the house.

The chimneys (2) on the 2-story house needs to be ground-out and tuckpointed. The stone sills on the top need relaying. Color of mortar used is to be historically significant dark mortar.

Chimney on garage (carriage house) will have all bricks and sills removed, cleaned and relaid.

Roof repair

The roof for the house is red Spanish tile and the same tiles that are currently on the home will be restored, except for those damaged. The previous repairs on the side porch ended with the tiles not finishing in line with the end of the porch. The tile line was not parallel to the recut underlayment and tiles must be removed and realigned so they end with a proper course at the edge of the porch. The south-west valley needs to be replaced. Also the valleys between the front porch and the entrance to the house are leaking and must be replaced.

Back Porch and Garage

Currently the back porch and garage have red asphalt shingles and they would both be repaired with new shingles, plywood and underlayment as required.



INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

1 City, Village or Town: BELOIT	County: ROCK	Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung	Date: July, 1981	Street Wisconsin		
Street Address: 816 Wisconsin Avenue		Legal Description:	Acreage:			
Current Name & Use: Residence		Current Owner:		Number 816		
Film Roll No. RO-87 *RO-111			Current Owner's Address:			
Negative No. 11 *34			Special Features Not Visible In Photographs:		Town Range Section Map Name NES Code	
Facade Orient. E	Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No					
2 Original Name & Use: Dr. Connell		Source	Previous Owners	Dates	Uses	Source
Dates of Construction/Alteration 1913		Source A				
Architect and/or Builder:		Source				
3 Architectural Significance <input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input checked="" type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input checked="" type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input type="radio"/> None				4 Historical Significance <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with lives of significant persons <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with significant historical events <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with development of a locality <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input checked="" type="radio"/> None		
Architectural Statement: An architecturally significant example of Prairie style influence in Beloit, this two story stucco house is dominated by rectangular massing, horizontal lines, and a variety of materials and textures. The ribbon windows (leaded casement on the second story, sash on the first), extended eaves, and a low retaining wall all stress the horizontal quality of the house. Wooden trim provides a highly linear decorative scheme, dividing the facade into horizontal panels and enframing the windows in horizontal bands, while heavy rafters extend beyond (over)				Historical Statement: Although built by Mrs. R. Watrous in 1913 (A), the house stood vacant until it was purchased four years later by Dr. and Mrs. Daniel Connell, a locally prominent surgeon and his wife. In the ensuing 68 years, only three families have lived there: Dr. and Mrs. Connell, Dr. and Mrs. G. W. Curless (1930-1960), and Dr. and Mrs. Walter Scholten (1960's to present). (B)		
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above) A Beloit Tax Rolls, RCHS Archives B City Directories, 1913-1968 C D E F				6 Representation in Previous Surveys <input type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other:		
7 Condition <input checked="" type="radio"/> excellent <input type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins				8 District: <u>Near East Side Historic Dist.</u> <input checked="" type="radio"/> pivotal <input type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: <u>R</u> date: <u>7/18/81</u>		
9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: <u>R</u>				Map Name: <u>Near East Side Historic District</u> NES Code: <u>87/11</u>		

Wisconsin Avenue
Architectural Statement (Continued)

the eaves. A cross gable and two story box bay window project slightly from the east wall but are held in low relief. The pedimented brick entry and the side porch are supported by squat, battered brick piers. Both the wooden trim and the tile roof--reminiscent of the Arts and Crafts movement as well as traditional Japanese architecture--enliven the solid stucco walls and provide an eclectic element to the Prairie massing. The house has a large lot and serves as an imposing landmark along Wisconsin Avenue, anchoring the northeast corner of the Near East Side Historic District.

rivotal

816 Wisconsin

East



East



North-
East



College
Park
Historic
District

East



South



6-17-91

CITY of BELOIT

Planning & Building Services Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 816 Wisconsin Avenue

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.	X		
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?	X		
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?			X
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?	X		
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.	X		
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?	X		
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?			X
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?	X		