

CITY OF BELOIT REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: September 18, 2018	Agenda Item: 4	File Number: COA-2018-23
Applicant: Judy Robson	Owner: St. Paul's Episcopal Church	Location: 212 W. Grand Avenue
Existing Zoning: PLI, Public Lands and Institutional District	Existing Land Use: Church	Parcel Size: 1.16 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Judy Robson on behalf of St. Paul's Episcopal Church has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to replace a retaining wall, add directional signs, and new landscaping for the property located at 212 W. Grand Avenue. The subject property is an individual Historic Landmark in between Bluff Street and Broad Street. Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a COA prior to the alteration of landmark structures.

Key Issues:

- The church was built in 1848 by C.W. Otis. The Beloit Intensive Survey of 1981 stated that this structure represents an example of early Gothic revival architecture and is a visual landmark in the area.
- It is the oldest church with continuous service in Rock County WI. See the attached Intensive Survey Form for more detailed information.
- Phase 1 will occur in the fall of 2018, and consist of:
 - Removing and replacing a new retaining wall that will consist of of keystone concrete retaining wall blocks between church foundation and wall.
 - Install two directional signs to direct visitors to church office.
- Phase 2 will occur between the spring and summer of 2019, and consist of:
 - Removal and replacement of the private sidewalk with new concrete.
 - Install new landscaping after retaining wall is complete. All existing foundation shrubs will be removed and replaced with boxwood and perennial plantings.

Staff Recommendation:

The Planning & Building Services Division recommends <u>approval</u> of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a retaining wall; add directional signs, and new landscaping at the property located at 212 W Grand Avenue, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

- 1. The applicant shall construct the projects consistent with the design and materials specified in the application attachments.
- 2. All work shall be completed by September 18, 2019.
- 3. The applicant shall obtain a Building Alteration Permit before beginning any work.
- 4. Final designs of the directional signs need to be approved by staff.
- 5. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: COA Application, Location Map, Photographs, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.

CITY of BELOIT PLANNING AND BUILDING SERVICES DIVISION 100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609 CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (Please Type or Print) File Number 1. Address of property: RANT 2. Parcel #: URCHPhone: 3. Owner of record: BEL 2121 DIT (Zip) (Address) (City) (State) OB 4. Applicant's Name: 212 AND (State) (City) Address) 20.4 dierop . 2 (Office Phone #) (Cell Phone #) mail Address 5. Present use of property: Church 6. The following action is requested: Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below) Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply) [] Roof repair/replacement] Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles [x] Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation] Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only) Γ

- [___] Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design
- [] Installation of fences
- [] Storm window/storm door repair or replacement
- [] Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

Planning Form No. 32

Page 1 of 2 Pages

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.
Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed
work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or
architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)
* 1 REPAIR FAILING RETAINING WALL (SEE ATTACHMENTS)
#2 ADD SIGNAGE DIRECTING VISITORS TO THE OFFICE (ATTACHMENT)
* 3 REPAIR PRIVATE SIDEWALKS (ATTERREIMENT)
4 NEW LANDSCAPING (ATTACHMENT)
8. Attachments:
[☆] Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
[X] Exterior photos
[X] Specifications (materials) for the project
[X] Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
[] Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
[X] Cost estimates for all the proposed work
Other (please explain):
9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:
NHS City of Beloit SHSW Federal
NOTE: The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.
If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).
(Signature of applicant) (Print name) (Date)
Review fees: \$50.00*// \$25.00* if staff approved Amount paid: \$50.00*/
Scheduled meeting date: 9 18 2018
Application accepted by: Ulawy Formann Date: 94 2018

Planning Form No. 32

Established: November 1993 (Revised: November, 2012)

Page 2 of 2 Pages

Location & Zoning Map

212 W. Grand Avenue

COA-2018-23



PHASE ONE FALL 2018

PROJECT #1 REPAIR FAILING RETAINING WALL

PROBLEM: The current retaining wall is decades old and made of poured concrete slabs which were not sunk into the ground below sidewalk level. Some of the slabs have tilted outward, away from the building and are no longer supporting the church foundation. To prevent shifting of the foundation of this historic site, a new retaining wall should be installed.

SOLUTION: The old retaining wall will be removed and a new block retaining wall will be installed with proper and appropriate drainage tiles and fill between the church foundation and wall. Please see attachments numbers 1-8. (Attachment #2, the site plan and drawing, indicates drainage going under the sidewalk and through the stone "railroad wall" east of the sidewalk; we will not be doing this.)

PROJECT #2 ADD SIGNAGE DIRECTING VISITORS TO THE OFFICE

PROBLEM: The office of St. Paul's Episcopal Church is located at the back of the building, just down from the parking lot. Visitors who are not familiar with the church and who stop by Monday through Saturday have no way of knowing how to get to the office.

SOLUTION: The congregation would like to erect two signs, one facing the east sidewalk and one facing the west sidewalk, directing visitors to the office. The signs would be no larger than 2 feet by 3 feet and made of appropriate material (wood or metal) and would blend with the sign currently in place in front of the building. The signs would be erected in the front yard of the church (not attached to the building itself), near the east and west sidewalks and would stand no higher than 5 feet tall. Please see attachment number 9.

PHASE TWO SPRING 2019

PROJECT #3 REPAIR PRIVATE SIDEWALKS

PROBLEM: The private, concrete sidewalks on the east, south and west sides of the building are in very poor condition and are considered by the congregation to be a liability. They are cracked, pitted and in many places, missisng chunks altogether. They have been patched many times as a short-term solution to the problem. Please see attachments numbers 10 & 11.

SOLUTION: The deteriorating areas of sidewalk will be removed and replaced with concrete sidewalk to match

what is currently there. The dimensions, placement and orientation will remain the same.

PROJECT #4 NEW LANDSCAPING

PROBLEM: The landscaping between the retaining wall and church foundation will, by necessity, be removed to replace the wall. The landscaping by the east side door is overgrown and not performing well. The landscaping in front of the church (on the north side) is overgrown and blocking the paths to the church door as well as the "St. Paul's Episcopal Church" sign.

SOLUTION: New landscaping will be installed on the east and north sides of the building, as specified in the landscaping contracts. Please see attachments numbers 4 & 12. Some or all of the landscaping may be completed during phase one, depending on weather.



EAST SIDE RETAINING WALL SHOWING THAT IT IS TILTED AND NO LONGER SUPPORTING CHURCH FOUNDATION

ATTACHMENT #1



Market Market

ATTACHMENT #2

ATTACHMENT #3

JIM JOHNSON president



August 31, 2018

St. Paul's Episcopal Church C/O: Judi¢Robson / Junior Warden

Subject: Retaining Wall

Description of material to be used for east side retaining wall at St. Paul's Episcopal Church 212 W. Grand Ave., Beloit, WI.

- The retaining wall is to be constructed using a "keystone wall system". The units to be used are standard and compac straight face brown in color (please see enclosed specification sheets and pictures for details). These units (blocks) are filled with gravel and attached using fiber glass dowels for stability.
- The landscaping (new plant material) portion of project is spelled out in separate proposal. All existing foundation shrubs are to be removed and replaced with boxwood and perennial plants in a similar configuration.

Please call with any questions or if any additional information is needed. Thank you.

Best regards

Jeff Page

(815) 885-2566 8176 STARWOOD DRIVE • LOVES PARK, ILLINOIS 61111

ATTACHMENT 1 4 JIM JOHNSON president



August 13, 2018

St. Paul's Episcopal Church C/O: Judi Robson / Junior Warden

Subject: Retaining Wall Replacement East Side

Details of the proposal below are based on the preliminary design done by Kontext Architects dated June 19, 2018.

- Remove all existing shrubs (burning bush and yews) along building and remove entire existing leaning concrete wall both sides of steps, excavate and prepare base for wall. Construct a new retaining wall and steps using "keystone wall systems" in straight face brown block with cap. This includes drain tile as indicated and restoring (straightening) existing wall in front and all necessary materials and labor. NOTE: Does not include any new cement sidewalk work.
- Install five (5) #5 green velvet boxwood, ten (10) #1 ornamental grass and flowering perennials and 30 #1 low growing sedum groundcover plants and bark mulch.
- Total: \$21,272.00

WARRANTY: RainMaster Irrigation warrants that the job shall be free from defects in material and workmanship for a period of two (2) years from date of completion of installation. All changes and/or modifications to the foregoing are required to be in writing and signed by both parties. This warranty is in lieu of all other warranties, whether expressed or implied, as to merchantability of fitness or purpose.

(815) 885-2566 8176 STARWOOD DRIVE • LOVES PARK, ILLINOIS 61111

Keystone Standard® Unit Series

NTRODUCTIO

N

THE KEYSTONE STANDARD UNIT IS AN AMERICAN ORIGINAL.

The product that started the industry is still the industry leader for tall walls and critical structures. The height-to-depth ratio of the Keystone Standard unit delivers a structurally sound, engineered wall system with superior construction stability, durability, and strength. Architects, engineers, and contractors rely on the Keystone Standard unit to stand strong when the safety and security of their wall designs matter.

	Standard I		Standard II	Standard III	
	8* (203mm)		8" (203mm)	8" (203mm)	
Unit Height	18" (457mm)		18" (457mm)	18" (457mm)	
Unit Width Unit Depth	18° (457mm)	21" (533mm)	18" (457mm)	18" (457mm)	21" (533mm)
Face Area per Unit	3	093m³)	1SF (0.093m ³)	1SF (0.	
Unit Weight	95-125lbs (43-57kg)		93-115lbs (42-52kg)	90-100 lbs (41-45kg)	
Volume of Voids to Tail	0.70 ft ³ /ft ² (0.21m ³ /m ²)	0.90 ft ³ /ft ² (0.27m ³ /m ²)	0.70 ft³/ft²(0.21m³/m²)	0.81 ft ³ /ft ² (0.25m ³ /m ²)	1.01 ft³/ft² (0.31m³/m²)
Volume of Voids to 24° depth	1.20 ft ³ /ft ² (0.37m ³ /m ²)	1.16 ft ³ /ft ² (0.35m ³ /m ²)	1.20 ft³/ft²(0.37m³/m²)	1.31 ft³/ft² (0.40m³/m²)	1.26 ft³/ft² (0.38m³/m²)
Fiberglass Pin	Straight Pin				

When weights, dimensions and availability vary by manufacturer. Please contact your local representative.



Standard I Tri-plane



Standard I Straight



Standard II Tri-plane



Tri-plane



Standard II Straight







3 Plane Standard I Unit Elevation



The information contained herein has been compiled by Keystone Retaining Wall Systems? LLC and to the best of our knowledge, accurately represents the Keystone product use in the applications which are illustrated. Final determination of the suitability for the use contemplated and its mannar of use are the sole responsibility of the user. Structural design and analysis shall be performed by a qualified engineer.

Zantana Construction Manual

INTRODUCTION

Keystone Compac[®] Unit Series

DESIGN AND BUILD WITH CONFIDENCE. The Keystone Compac is the perfect choice when the deep embedment length of the Keystone Standard unit is not required. An installer's favorite, its lighter weight and shorter tail design make it easy to handle.

	Compac II	Compac III			
Unit Height	8" (203mm)	8" (203mm)			
Unit Width	18" (457mm)	18" (457mm)			
Unit Depth	12" (305mm)	12" (305mm)			
Face Area per Unit	1SF (0.093m ³)				
Unit Weight	78-91lbs (35-41kg)	69-77lbs (31-35kg)			
Volume of Voids to Tail	0.35 ft³/ft²(0.11m³/m²)	0.41 ft ³ /ft ² (0.12m ³ /m ²)			
Volume of Voids to 12" depth	1.35 ft³/ft²(0.41m³/m²)	1.41 ft³/ft²(0.43m³/m²)			
Fiberglass Pin	Straight Pin				

Note: Unit weights, dimensions and availability vary by manufacturer. Please contact your local representative.



www.keystonewalls.com





ATTACHMENT #9

EAST SIDEWALK SIGN:

OFFICE Follow sidewalk to red door Ring doorbell

WEST SIDEWALK SIGN:

OFFICE Follow sidewalk to back door Ring bell



WEST SIDEWALK SHOWING CRACKING AND PITTING

ATTACHMENT #10



WEST SIDEWALK SHOWING WHERE AREAS OF MISSING CONCRETE HAS BEEN PATCHED

ATTACHMENT # 11

ATTACHMENT #12

JIM JOHNSON president



August 13, 2018

St. Paul's Episcopal Church 212 W. Grand Ave. Beloit, WI

Subject: Description of Proposed Landscape Work

Please review the breakdown of tasks outlined below and call with any questions. Thank you.

- East side (other than area adjacent to building which is included in separate proposal). Remove all other old overgrown plant material (yew, juniper and lilies) and install 1 #5 green mountain boxwood, 4 #3 green velvet boxwood, 3 #5 crimson pygmy barberry and 9 #1 perennials.
- North side (front) adjacent to building. East of entrance remove existing burning bush and yew plants, install plants to hide air units but not impede air circulation. Install 4 #5 green mountain boxwood and mixed perennials....West of entrance – remove existing yews, install 3 #5 green mountain boxwood and mixed perennials.
- West side adjacent to building. Remove existing burning bush and yew plants, install 4 #5 green velvet boxwood, 8 #1 perennials and groundcover (to match plantings on east side).

(815) 885-2566 8176 STARWOOD DRIVE • LOVES PARK, ILLINOIS 61111



	toric Preserva	ation 1	Division Sta	te Histori	cal Soc	ciety of	Visco	nsin
CiCy, Village or Town:	County:		Surveyor:			Date:		
BELOIT	ROCK		Richard P. Hartung		July,	1981	Grand	
Street Address:			Legal Description	on:		Acreage:		Grand,
212 West Grand Avenue						0.75	5	Wes
Guilent Mane & Use:			Current Owner:					st
St. Paul's Episcopal Ch	lurch		St. Paul's E Current Owner's	piscopal (hurch			
			Current Owner's	Address:				
RO-94 Negative No.			Same		<u> </u>			
			Special Features	NOT VISLUT	e In Pho	tographs:	/	Nun
11 Facade Orient.		÷						Number 212
Original Name & Use:				nterior vis		Ø ^{Yes} C) No	
2		Source	Previous Owners	Dates	Uses		Source	Town
St. Paul's Episcopal Ch Dates of Construction /Alteration	urch	Source		·	ļ		ļ	1 1
		bource						_
1848-1851 Architect and/or Builder:		A						Range
		bource					ļ	nge
<u>C. W. Otis (attributed :</u> Architectural Significance	to)	<u> </u>	🙍 Historical Si	gnifigance	<u> </u>			ļ
3 Represents work of a master Possesses high artistic values			Assoc. wit	h lives of	signific	ant person	ns	Sei
 Represents a type, period, or Is a visual landmark in the ar 	method of constr	uction		ch significa ch developme	nt histo nt of a	rıcal even locality	nts	Section
Other:	O Non	e	O Other: None	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				7
Architectural Statement:			Historical St	atement:				Мар
St. Paul's Episcopal Church is	s significant	as an	St. Paul's Ep					z
outstanding example of early G architecture constructed of na			maintained an first service					_{Name} City
limestone and excellently mair	itained. It i	s	ber of 1851.	It is the	e oldes	t church	n in	m.
among the oldest stone Gothic in the state. The main block	churches exta	nt ic	continuous se cornerstone w					ngi
40 feet by 58 feet, 6 inches,	with articula	ted	1848 on land	donated by	/ pione	er settl	er	ne
five-bay sides and a three-bay by a three-story tower. The t			John Hackett, crated, with					er's
by an octagonal spire which so	ars 100 feet	above	1856, by Bish				,	
ground. Tall lancet windows a engaged, stepped buttresses at	re flanked by	vor	St. Paul's was Registered La					
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above) 6 Representatio						<u>o</u> landma	where the second s	
A National Register of Histo	ric Places		O HABS O NAER O other:	⊗ wihp 1967 4	⊗ NRHP -4-78		rĸ	
Inventory-Nomination Fo	rm, 1976		7 Condition		~	\sim		
<u><u></u></u>				good Ofa	<u>ír Up</u>	oor Ur	uins	
C			U					^{Мар} СЕ
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		-	ontributing			ıng	Map Code CE 94
D			initials:	<u> </u>	date			^{ode} 94/1
2021 Яла Мара		Í	9 Opinion of Nat					Ľ
B222				ot eligible			o.	
			Onational Os	state Olo	cal	initials:		
				-		HP-02-1	.7	

....itectural Statement (Cont'd)

of the building. The buttressed corners are topped with pointed finials, and the corners of the tower are buttressed as well. Pointed arches punctuate the tower front. Above the doorway is a tripartite window of simple tracery at the second level and, above a simply dentiled string course, are two lancet windows on the third level. The rugged texture of random-cut ashlar limestone contrasts with the smoothness of finials and roof. The interior dark pine ceiling is braced with crossbeams which extend between the windows and which support rondels under the ceiling ridge. Although the design cannot be attributed with certainty to any architect, the building is a worthy example of early Gothic Revival architecture in the Upper Midwest, with fine proportions, skilled craftsmanship, and a commanding yet graceful design. The plan, dimensions and elevation are virtually identical to the "original sketch plans" by C. W. Otis for Grace Episcopal Church in Galena, Illinois, as recorded by the Historic American Building Survey. (A)

Historical Statement (Cont'd)

1967, and entered in the National Register of Historic Places in April, 1978. (A)









CITY of BELOIT Neighborhood Planning Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 703 Park Avenue

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.	X		
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?			X
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?	X		
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?			X
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.	X		
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?			X
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?	X		
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?	X		