

CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: April 20, 2010

Agenda Item: 5

File Number: COA-2010-09

Applicant: Anne Meronk

Owner: Lois A. Siler Revocable Trust

Location: 816 Harrison Avenue

Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family Residential District

Existing Land Use: Single-Family Dwelling

Parcel Size: 0.21 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Anne Meronk has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to tuckpoint the house and to demolish a detached carriage house (a/k/a "garage") for the property located at 816 Harrison Avenue. The applicant has indicated that the structure is unstable due to rotting and termite damage, and that the structure will eventually collapse. Section 32.07 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to demolition of a historic structure.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

Key Issues:

- Several photographs of the property are attached to this report. As shown in the photographs, the structure is leaning to the north.
- A Building Inspector has inspected the carriage house, and has confirmed the applicant's statements regarding instability.
- This property's designation as a Historic Landmark is due to the house's architectural and historical significance. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- The house was built around 1900, and the garage was constructed around 1920. The Planning Division has a photograph of the property that was allegedly taken in the mid-1920's. The photograph clearly shows the carriage house and the weathered paint suggests that it was constructed several years before the photograph was taken.
- **Findings of Fact:** Section 32.07(2) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes standards to be used in determining whether to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness for any demolition. The Ordinance states that the Commission shall consider and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:

- (a) *Whether the historic building is of such architectural or historic significance that this demolition would be detrimental to the public interest and contrary to the general welfare of the people of the City and the State.*

The carriage house is a historic structure. However, the historical significance of this property is mainly due to the house. Demolishing the carriage house will not be detrimental to the public interest nor contrary to the general welfare.

- (b) *Whether an historic building which has not been designated as an historic landmark, contributes to the distinctive architectural or historic character of the historic district as a whole and, therefore, should be preserved for the benefit of the people of the City and the State.*

This property is a Historic Landmark.

- (c) *Whether demolition of the historic building would be contrary to the purpose and intent of this chapter as set forth in section 32.01 and to the objective of the historic preservation plan for the applicable district as adopted by the City Council.*

Unfortunately, demolition of the carriage house is somewhat contrary to the purpose and intent of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, as the structure reflects a bygone mode of transportation.

- (d) *Whether the historic building is of such old and unusual or uncommon design, texture and/or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.*

The structure could be reproduced, but the difficulty and expense of doing so is difficult to gauge.

- (e) *Whether retention of the historic building would promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.*

It's unlikely that retention of the carriage house would encourage or contribute to the study of American history, culture, and/or heritage.

- (f) *Whether any hardship or difficulty claimed by the owner is self-created or the result of the owner's failure to maintain the property in good repair.*

The hardship claimed by the owner is not self-created.

- (g) *Whether any new structure proposed to be constructed or any change in use proposed to be made is compatible with nearby historic buildings or the historic district in which the subject property is located.*

The use of the house will remain unchanged.

- Tuckpointing of historic structures must be completed according to the Secretary of the Interior's standards.

Sustainability: (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels – N/A
- Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature – N/A
- Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems – N/A
- Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently – N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends **approval** of a Certificate of Appropriateness to tuckpoint the house and to demolish a detached carriage house for the property located at 816 Harrison Avenue, based on the above Findings of Fact and subject to the following conditions:

1. The tuckpointing shall be completed according to the Secretary of the Interior's standards.
2. Following demolition of the carriage house, the ground shall be leveled and restored to grass.
3. All work shall be completed by December 31, 2010.
4. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
5. The applicant must obtain all necessary building and/or demolition permits. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photographs, Application, and Intensive Survey Form.



04/06/2010 15:30



04/06/2010 15:27



CITY of BELOIT

NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: COA-2010-09

1. Address of property: 816 HARRISON AVE
2. Parcel #: 13670660
3. Owner of record: LOIS A. SILER ^{REVOCABLE TRUST} Phone: 715-335-4105
P.O. Box 12 PLAINFIELD WIS. 54966
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)
4. Applicant's Name: ANNE E. MERONK ^{P.O.A. + TRUSTEE}
P.O. Box 12 PLAINFIELD WIS. 54966
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)
715-335-4105, 507-458-1851
(Office Phone #) (Cell Phone #) (E-mail Address)
HOME
5. Present use of property: RENTAL TO MY SISTER +
6. The following action is requested: LOIS SILER'S DAUGHTER

Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)

Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)

Roof repair/replacement

Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles

Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation

Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)

Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design

Installation of fences

Storm window/storm door repair or replacement

Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

CARRIAGE HOUSE IS LEANING + WILL EVENTUALLY COLLAPSE. IT HAS BEEN STRAIGHTENED + SHORED UP ONCE ALREADY. 2x4'S + 4x4'S ARE ROTTED + HAVE TERMITES ON NORTH SIDE BASE.

8. Attachments:

- Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
- Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
- Exterior photos
- Specifications (materials) for the project
- Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
- Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
- Cost estimates for all the proposed work
- Other (please explain): _____

9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:

- NHS City of Beloit SHSW Federal

NOTE:

The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).


Anne E. Meronk P.O.A. ANNE E. MERONK 4/5/2010
(Signature of applicant) + Trustee (Print name) (Date)

Review fee: <u>\$45.00 / \$25.00 if staff approved</u>	Amount paid: \$ <u>45.⁰⁰</u>
Scheduled meeting date: <u>April 29, 2010</u>	
Application accepted by: <u>D. Pennington</u>	Date: <u>4/5/2010</u>

24

City, Village or Town: BELOIT	County: ROCK	Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung	Date: July, 1981
Street Address: 816 Harrison Avenue		Legal Description: L. 3, B: 17, Original Plat	Acreage:

Current Name & Use: Residence	Current Owner: Hazel Paige Lipman
---	---

Film Roll No. RO-102		Current Owner's Address: Same
Negative No. 9		Special Features Not Visible In Photographs:
Facade Orient. E		Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No
Prints		

Original Name & Use:	Source	Previous Owners	Dates	Uses	Source
2					
Dates of Construction / Alteration c. 1900	Source A				
Architect and/or Builder:	Source				

3 Architectural Significance

Represents work of a master
 Possesses high artistic values
 Represents a type, period, or method of construction
 Is a visual landmark in the area
 Other: _____ None

4 Historical Significance

Assoc. with lives of significant persons
 Assoc. with significant historical events
 Assoc. with development of a locality
 Other: _____
 None

Architectural Statement:

Late picturesque house with Colonial Revival details including well proportioned dormers with broken pediments and round arched windows with wood keystone. Front porch has Tuscan columns but massing of the house remains asymmetrical and picturesque.

Historical Statement:

5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above)

A Visual estimate of surveyor

6 Representation in Previous Surveys

HABS NAER WIHP NRHP landmark
 other: _____

B

7 Condition

excellent good fair poor ruins

C

8 District: _____

pivotal contributing non-contributing

D

initials: _____ date: _____

E

9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility

eligible not eligible unknown

F

national state local initials: **RL**

Harrison

816

City Engineer's

CE 102/9