

CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: June 15, 2010

Agenda Item: 5

File Number: COA-2010-22

Applicant: Gilbank Construction Inc.

Owner: Mission Investment Fund of
the Evangelical Lutheran Church

Location: 717 Bluff Street

Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family
Residential District

Existing Land Use: Church

Parcel Size: 8,279 square feet

Request Overview/Background Information:

Gilbank Construction Inc. has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to remove the chimney and to replace portions of the roof for the property located at 717 Bluff Street. The applicant has been hired to remedy ongoing water leaks and damage. By removing the chimney and replacing deteriorated portions of the roof, the applicant hopes to prevent rain from entering the structure.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

Key Issues:

- Several aerial photos of the church are attached to this report, and the chimney is identified with an arrow.
- The applicant has submitted several photos of the affected areas, which will be distributed during the meeting.
- The proposed work is not expected to result in any additional changes to the exterior of this structure.
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the church was classified as a pivotal structure within the Bluff Street Historic District. The church was constructed in 1877. The Survey Form notes that the church is “an outstanding and well-preserved example of vernacular Victorian Gothic architecture.” The Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes *Specific Review Criteria* to be used in evaluating COA applications. For this particular application, applicable review criteria include:
 - (1) *Roof shape:* *The design of the roof should first be compatible with the architectural style and character of the landmark itself and then, if necessary, with other surrounding structures in the historic district.*
 - The applicant has not proposed any changes to the shape of the roof.
 - (2) *Architectural Details:* *Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.*
 - The cement chimney is not critical to the historical integrity of the structure. The removal of the chimney will resolve an ongoing water damage issue.
 - The applicant will use shingles that match the existing shingles.
- Section 32.06(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Landmarks Commission may grant a COA if it determines that the proposed construction, reconstruction, or exterior alteration conforms to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for the City and district. Staff believes that the proposed actions, subject to certain conditions, satisfy the standards of Section 32.06(6)(c).

Sustainability: (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- **Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels** – The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were constructed when walking was a primary mode of travel.

- **Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature – N/A**
 - **Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems – N/A**
 - **Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently – N/A**
-

Staff Recommendation:

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends **approval** of a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove the chimney and to replace portions of the roof for the property located at 717 Bluff Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

1. Following removal of the chimney, the exposed siding and fascia shall be restored to match the surrounding siding and fascia.
 2. The applicant shall use shingles that match the existing shingles as closely as possible.
 3. All work shall be completed by May 31, 2011.
 4. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
 5. The applicant must obtain all necessary building permits. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.
-

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photos, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.



CITY of BELOIT

NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: COA-2010-ZZ

1. Address of property: 717 Bluff Street

2. Parcel #: 13520095

(ECLA)

3. Owner of record: Mission Investment Fund, Phone: 630-761-8650

8 South Lincoln

Batavia

IL

60510

(Address)

(City)

(State)

(Zip)

4. Applicant's Name: Gilbank Construction Inc

301 Scot Drive

Clinton

WI

53525

(Address)

(City)

(State)

(Zip)

(608) 676-2261

(608) 751-7788

Jamesg@gilbankconstruction.com

(Office Phone #)

(Cell Phone #)

(E-mail Address)

5. Present use of property: Place of Worship

6. The following action is requested:

Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)

Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)

Roof repair/replacement

Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles

Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation

Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)

Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design

Installation of fences

Storm window/storm door repair or replacement

Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

Project consists of fixing/reroofing portions of the roof as well as removing the existing chimney. If chimney is approved to be removed we would roof as necessary to fix the current leaks and match existing roof as closely as possible.

8. Attachments:

Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)

Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos

Exterior photos

Specifications (materials) for the project

Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)

Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)

Cost estimates for all the proposed work

Other (please explain): _____

9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:

NHS

City of Beloit

SHSW

Federal

NOTE:

The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).

James Gulbank | James Gulbank | 5/27/10
(Signature of applicant) (Print name) (Date)

Review fee: \$45.00 / \$25.00 if staff approved	Amount paid: \$ <u>45.00</u>
Scheduled meeting date: <u>June 15, 2010</u>	
Application accepted by: <u>Drew Pennington</u>	Date: <u>5/27/2010</u>

INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

City, village or Town: BELOIT		County: ROCK		Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung		Date: July, 1981		Street Bluff
Street Address: 717 Bluff Street				Legal Description:		Acreage:		
Current Name & Use: Foursquare Church				Current Owner: International Church of Foursquare Gospel				Number 717
Film Roll No. RO-93 *RO-112				Current Owner's Address: 261 St. Lawrence Avenue, Beloit, Wisconsin				
Negative No. 20 *25				Special Features Not Visible In Photographs:				Section
Facade Orient. W				Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No				
2	Original Name & Use: Norwegian Lutheran Church		Source A, B	Previous Owners Norwegian Lutheran	Dates 1877	Uses Church	Source A, B	Town
	Dates of Construction/Alteration 1877		Source C, A	Christian Church	1919	Church	C	Range
	Architect and/or Builder:		Source					
3	Architectural Significance							Map Name Bluff Street Historic District
	<input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input checked="" type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input checked="" type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input type="radio"/> None							
Architectural Statement: An outstanding and well-preserved example of vernacular Victorian Gothic architecture, this simple frame church is distinguished by its steeply-pitched gable roof, its pointed arch windows, and an engaged square entry tower. The tower, which is truncated and capped with a denticulated cornice, features a large pointed arch window with simple wooden tracery and stained glass. Below that, the entry door is surrounded by a round arched frame. The front (west) elevation has a pointed arch window with stained glass on either side of the entry, (over)				Historical Statement: Built in 1877, the Norwegian Lutheran Church was constructed on land donated by John Thompson, a Norwegian immigrant who owned the Thompson Plow Works in Beloit. (A) Later known as Trinity Church, this building housed the Trinity Lutheran congregation, originally formed in 1855 by Norwegian immigrants with the help of Orfordville pastors. Their services were originally held exclusively in Norwegian. The building was sold to the Christian Church in 1919 after Trinity (over)				Map Code BS 93/20
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above)				6 Representation in Previous Surveys				
A Beloit Tax Records				<input type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other: _____				
B Beloit City Directories				7 Condition <input type="radio"/> excellent <input type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins				
C Home Town, Oscar Thompson, p. 33				8 District: Bluff Street Historic District <input checked="" type="radio"/> pivotal <input type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: R date: 01/18/81				
D Book of Beloit, 1936, p. 118				9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: R				
E History of Rock County, 1908, p. 276								
F								

Architectural Statement (Continued)

While the north and south elevations have four regularly spaced arched windows, all ornamented with stained glass. Although its smooth clapboard siding and rectangular massing are purely vernacular, the pitch of the gable and the point of the arch are clearly Gothic in spirit if not precise in execution.

Historical Statement (Continued)

Lutheran joined Bethlehem Lutheran in forming Our Savior's Lutheran Church in 1918. (A, D, E)

CITY of BELOIT

Neighborhood Planning Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 717 Bluff Street

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.	X		
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?	X		
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?			X
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?	X		
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.	X		
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?			X
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?	X		
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?			X