

CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Meeting Date: May 17, 2011

Agenda Item: 4

File Number: COA-2011-04

Applicant: Michael Brady, on behalf of Beloit College

Owner: Beloit College

Location: 700 College Street

Existing Zoning: PLI, Public Lands & Institutions District

Existing Land Use: Academic Building

Parcel Size: 21.22 Acres

Request Overview/Background Information:

Michael Brady, on behalf of Beloit College, has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to replace all of the windows in the World Affairs Center building addressed as 634 College Street, which is located on the property located at 700 College Street. The subject property is located in the College Park Historic District, and Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a COA prior to the alteration of structures within a Historic District.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

Key Issues:

- Several photographs of the World Affairs Center building are attached to this report.
- The applicant has proposed the use of customized aluminum clad wood double-hung windows manufactured by Marvin Windows & Doors.
- Many of the windows include stained glass sections, which the applicant will protect during construction and reinstall on the inside of the replacement windows in the same locations.
- The applicant has submitted a material sample, which will be distributed during the meeting.
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the building was classified as a 'pivotal' structure within the College Park Historic District. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes *Specific Review Criteria* to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application:

- (1) *Proportions of Windows and Doors:* The proportions and relationship between doors and windows should be compatible with the architectural style and character of the landmark, or in the case of new construction, with surrounding structures within the historic district.

The applicant has not proposed any changes to the size of the window openings.

- (2) *Architectural Details:* Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.

The applicant has proposed the installation of aluminum clad wood windows, which are compatible with the architectural style and character of the building. Although the original windows will be replaced, the significance of this building is due to the architectural features (e.g. columns & moldings). The cornices and sills will not be altered.

- Section 32.06(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Landmarks Commission may grant a COA if it determines:
 - (a) In the case of a landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which the work is to be done.

- (b) In the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would not adversely affect or would harmonize with the external appearance of other improvements on such site.
- (c) In the case of any property located in an historic district, the proposed construction, reconstruction, or exterior alteration conforms to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for the City and district.

- Staff believes that the proposed actions, subject to certain conditions, satisfy the standards of Section 32.06(6)(c).

Sustainability: (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- **Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels** – The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were developed when walking was a primary mode of travel.
- **Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature** – N/A
- **Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems** – N/A
- **Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently** – N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all of the windows in the World Affairs Center building addressed as 634 College Street, which is located on the property located at 700 College Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall use the materials that are described in the application and attachments.
2. All of the existing stained glass windows shall be protected during removal and hung or mounted on the inside of the replacement windows in the same exact locations.
3. All work shall be completed by June 1, 2012.
4. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
5. The applicant shall obtain a Building Permit before beginning construction. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photographs, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.





CITY of BELOIT

NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: COA-2011-04

1. Address of property: 634⁽⁷⁰⁰⁾ College ST

2. Parcel #: 13660330

3. Owner of record: Beloit College Phone: 608-363-2200

700 College ST Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

4. Applicant's Name: Steve Gottschall

700 College ST Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)

608-363-2200 1 608-751-2235 1 gottschallS@Beloit.edu
(Office Phone #) (Cell Phone #) (E-mail Address)

5. Present use of property: _____

6. The following action is requested:

Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)

Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)

Roof repair/replacement

Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles

Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation

Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)

Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design

Installation of fences

Storm window/storm door repair or replacement

Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

New Replacement window will Replace Existing Windows, Windows will match existing style window with more efficient glass

World Affairs Center Building

8. Attachments:

- Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
- Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
- Exterior photos *Drew Pennington took photos*
- Specifications (materials) for the project *pp*
- Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
- Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
- Cost estimates for all the proposed work
- Other (please explain): _____

9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:

- NHS City of Beloit SHSW Federal

NOTE:


The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).

M. Brady *1 MICHAEL BRADY* *4/13/11*
 (Signature of applicant) (Print name) (Date)

Review fee: \$50.00* / \$25.00* if staff approved	Amount paid: \$ <i>50.00</i>
* Review fees are doubled to \$100.00 and \$50.00, respectively, when work begins prior to issuance of a COA.	
Scheduled meeting date: <i>May 13, 2011</i>	
Application accepted by: <i>Drew Pennington</i>	Date: <i>4/15/11</i>

INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

1 City, Village or Town: BELOIT		County: ROCK	Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung	Date: July, 1981	BELLOIT COLLEGE CAMPUS Pettibone World Affairs Ctr. number Town Range Section Map Name NES 83/29 Map Code		
Street Address: BELOIT COLLEGE CAMPUS Pettibone World Affairs Center		Legal Description: See ISF--Middle College		Acres: 			
Current Name & Use: Pettibone World Affairs Study Center		Current Owner: The Trustees of Beloit College					
Film Roll No. RO-83 *RO-112		Current Owner's Address: 700 College Avenue, Beloit, Wisconsin					
Negative No. 29, 30 *7		Special Features Not Visible In Photographs: 					
Facade Orient. E	Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No						
2 Original Name & Use: Carnegie Library		Source A	Previous Owners	Dates		Uses	Source
Dates of Construction/Alteration 1903-1905		Source A					
Architect and/or Builder: Patton and Miller, Chicago		Source A					
3 Architectural Significance <input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input checked="" type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input checked="" type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input type="radio"/> None		4 Historical Significance <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with lives of significant persons <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with significant historical events <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with development of a locality <input checked="" type="radio"/> Other: <u>Associated with development of Beloit College</u> <input type="radio"/> None					
Architectural Statement: Built originally as a Carnegie Library, the World Affairs Center is architecturally significant as the finest extant example in Beloit of the Classical Revival which influenced institutional architecture in the early 20th century. A rectangular block, with projecting central pavilion and chamfered sides, the building is crowned with a heavy but crisply molded cornice, topped by a parapet. In the central pavilion, a recessed entry, supported by colossal Corinthian columns and engaged pilasters, features a doorway framed by (over)		Historical Statement: Funded with a gift of \$50,000.00 from Andrew Carnegie, ground was broken in December, 1903, the cornerstone was laid on May 27, 1904, and the building dedicated on January 5, 1905. The President's office was on the main floor of the new building after its opening, and the building served as the college library until the completion of the Morse Library in 1962. The building, on being vacated, was remodelled to serve as the World Affairs Center (Pettibone Center), (over)					
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above) A R. H. Irrmann, "Data on Beloit College Buildings," on file at RCHS Archives		6 Representation in Previous Surveys <input type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other: _____					
B National Register of Historic Places, Inventory--Nomination Form, 1979, for Emerson Hall		7 Condition <input checked="" type="radio"/> excellent <input type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins					
C		8 District: <u>Near East Side Historic Dist.</u> <input checked="" type="radio"/> pivotal <input type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: <u>R</u> date: <u>8/1/81</u>					
D		9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: <u>R</u>					
E							
F							

Beloit College Campus--Pettibone World Affairs Center
Architectural Statement (Continued)

carved festoons and geometric moldings and surrounded by colossal Corinthian pilasters. Window frames throughout have unornamented projecting cornices and sills. The stone is laid with deep joints, to give the appearance of massiveness and solidity.

The firm of Patton and Miller was extant between 1901 and 1912. Patton was associated with many other institutional buildings and libraries throughout the country during his career, and with several buildings at Beloit College between 1893 and 1905. They include Emerson Hall (c.f., 1897-1898, NRHP, 1979), the Student Union (c.f., 1903-1904) and the Pettibone World Affairs Center (c.f., 1903-1905). (B)

Historical Statement (Continued)

housing the World Affairs offices, and the faculty offices and classrooms for modern languages and some members of the English department.



CITY of BELOIT
Neighborhood Planning Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 634 (700) College Street

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.	X		
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?	X		
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?			X
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?	X		
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.			X
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?			X
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?	X		
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?	X		