

# CITY OF BELOIT

## REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

---

**Meeting Date:** September 20, 2011

**Agenda Item:** 4

**File Number:** COA-2011-21

**Applicant:** Ron Draves Remodeling

**Owner:** Stephen Tilley

**Location:** 644 Park Avenue

**Existing Zoning:** R-1B, Single-Family Residential District

**Existing Land Use:** Single-Family Dwelling

**Parcel Size:** 0.21 Acre

---

### Request Overview/Background Information:

Ron Draves Remodeling has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to install vinyl siding on the detached garage for the property located at 644 Park Avenue. The subject property is located in the College Park Historic District. Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a COA prior to the alteration of structures within a Historic District.

---

### Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance. Consideration of this request supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #4.

---

### Key Issues:

- Several photographs of the subject property are attached to this report.
- In June 2011, the property owner was ordered to replace the deteriorated siding on the garage. In lieu of replacing the rotten siding boards, the property owner has opted to install vinyl siding on the garage.
- Vinyl siding was installed on the house in 1994, following Landmarks Commission approval of a COA to install vinyl siding and to wrap the soffit, fascia, and trim.
- The house was built in 1888. During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house was classified as a 'contributing' structure within the College Park Historic District. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- The detached garage was built in 1968 and has no historical significance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes *Specific Review Criteria* to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application:

- (1) *Architectural Details*: *Architectural details, including materials, colors and textures, should be treated so as to make a landmark compatible with the original architectural style or character of the landmark in the historic district.*

The applicant has proposed the installation of double 4" vinyl siding that is "Oxford Blue" in color. Although the color of the proposed siding matches the color of the house siding, the house siding has a smooth or brushed stroke finish. The difference is visible in the attached photo. The vinyl siding to be installed on the garage must have a similar finish, and the applicant will need to submit a revised sample before a Building Permit will be issued.

- Section 32.06(6) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance states that the Landmarks Commission may grant a COA if it determines:
  - (a) In the case of a landmark or landmark site, the proposed work would not detrimentally change, destroy, or adversely affect any exterior architectural feature of the improvement upon which the work is to be done.
  - (b) In the case of the construction of a new improvement upon a landmark site, the exterior of such improvement would not adversely affect or would harmonize with the external appearance of other improvements on such site.
  - (c) In the case of any property located in an historic district, the proposed construction, reconstruction, or exterior alteration conforms to the objectives and design criteria of the historic preservation plan for the City and district.

- Staff believes that the proposed actions, subject to certain conditions, satisfy the standards of Section 32.06(6)(c).

---

**Sustainability:** (Briefly comment on the sustainable long term impact of this policy or program related to how it will impact both the built and natural environment utilizing the four following eco-municipality guidelines)

- **Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels** – The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were developed when walking was a primary mode of travel.
- **Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature** – N/A
- **Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems** – N/A
- **Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently** – N/A

---

**Staff Recommendation:**

The Neighborhood Planning Division recommends approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness to install vinyl siding on the detached garage for the property located at 644 Park Avenue, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall install double 4” vinyl siding with a smooth or brushed stroke finish that matches the existing siding on the house. A revised sample must be reviewed and approved by staff before a Building Permit will be issued.
2. The vinyl siding shall be installed over the existing siding.
3. All work shall be completed by November 1, 2011.
4. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.
5. The applicant shall obtain a Building Permit before beginning any work. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from the Housing Services Division.

---

**Fiscal Note/Budget Impact:** N/A

---

**Attachments:** Photographs, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.



**CITY of BELOIT**  
**NEIGHBORHOOD PLANNING DIVISION**

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511      Phone: (608) 364-6700      Fax: (608) 364-6609

**CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION**

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: COA-2011-21

1. Address of property: 644 Park Ave

2. Parcel #: 1366 0445

3. Owner of record: Steve Tilley Phone: 365-3385

644 Park Ave      Beloit      WI      53511  
(Address)      (City)      (State)      (Zip)

4. Applicant's Name: Ron Draves Remodeling

858 E. Briar Lane      Beloit      WI      53511  
(Address)      (City)      (State)      (Zip)

365-5075      1 751-6764      1 dravesremodeling@charter.net  
(Office Phone #)      (Cell Phone #)      (E-mail Address)

5. Present use of property: \_\_\_\_\_

6. The following action is requested:

- Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)
- Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)
  - Roof repair/replacement
  - Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles
  - Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation
  - Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)
  - Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design
  - Installation of fences
  - Storm window/storm door repair or replacement
  - Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

**CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)**

**7. Description of Project:** Describe each item of the project separately.

**Project item:** Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

Residing Garage only

**8. Attachments:**

- Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
- Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
- Exterior photos
- Specifications (materials) for the project
- Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
- Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
- Cost estimates for all the proposed work
- Other (please explain): \_\_\_\_\_

**9. Source of Funds:** Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:

- NHS       City of Beloit       SHSW       Federal

**NOTE:**

The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).

Ronald Draves      1 Ronald Draves      1 8/12/11  
(Signature of applicant)      (Print name)      (Date)

Review fee: <b>\$50.00* / \$25.00* if staff approved</b> Amount paid: \$ <u>50.<sup>00</sup></u>	
* Review fees are doubled to \$100.00 and \$50.00, respectively, when work begins prior to issuance of a COA.	
Scheduled meeting date: <u>September 20, 2011</u>	Date: <u>8/12/11</u>
Application accepted by: <u>Don Pennington</u>	

INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

1 City, Village or Town: <b>BELOIT</b>		County: <b>ROCK</b>	Surveyor: <b>Richard P. Hartung</b>		Date: <b>July, 1981</b>	Street <b>Park</b>	
Street Address: <b>644 Park Avenue</b>			Legal Description:	Acreage:			
Current Name & Use: <b>Residence</b>			Current Owner:				
Film Roll No. <b>RO-85</b>	Affix Contact Prints  <b>See ISF for 636 Park Avenue</b>		Current Owner's Address:				Number <b>644</b>
Negative No. <b>37</b>			Special Features Not Visible In Photographs:				
Facade Orient. <b>E</b>			Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No				
2 Original Name & Use:		Source	Previous Owners	Dates	Uses	Source	Town
Dates of Construction /Alteration <b>c. 1880's</b>		Source <b>A</b>					Range
Architect and/or Builder:		Source					Section
3 Architectural Significance <input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input checked="" type="radio"/> None			4 Historical Significance <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with lives of significant persons <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with significant historical events <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with development of a locality <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input checked="" type="radio"/> None				Map Name <b>Near East Side Historic District</b>
Architectural Statement:  Two and one half story late picturesque style frame house with intersecting gable and hip roofs. Remodeled entrance and front porch. Front first floor window has a pent roof above.			Historical Statement:				
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above) <b>A Visual estimate of surveyor</b>			6 Representation in Previous Surveys <input type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other:				Map Code <b>NES 85/378</b>
<b>B</b>			7 Condition <input type="radio"/> excellent <input checked="" type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins				
<b>C</b>			8 District: <b>Near East Side Historic Dist.</b> <input type="radio"/> pivotal <input checked="" type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: <b>R</b> date: <b>8/1/81</b>				
<b>D</b>			9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: <b>R</b>				
<b>E</b>							
<b>F</b>							



***CITY of BELOIT***  
**Neighborhood Planning Division**

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511 Phone: (608) 364-6700 Fax: (608) 364-6609

<b>CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST</b>
---

For property located at: 644 Park Avenue

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.	X		
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?			X
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?			X
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?			X
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.			X
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?			X
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?	X		
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?	X		