

CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Meeting Date: January 21, 2014

Agenda Item: 4

File Number: COA-2013-43

Applicant: Beloit College

Owner: Beloit College

Location: 726 Church Street

Existing Zoning: PLI: Public Lands/Institutions, and WPO; Wellhead Protection Overlay District

Existing Land Use: Office Use

Parcel Size: .2850 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Beloit College has submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to repair the porch handrails for the property located at 726 Church Street. This property is located in the College Park Historic District. Section 32.06 of the Historic Preservation Ordinance grants the Landmarks Commission the authority to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness prior to the alteration of properties within Historic Districts.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

This request is consistent with the intent and purpose of the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Goal #5.

Key Issues:

- The applicant has proposed to repair the porch handrails for the above listed property. The applicant has not proposed any other changes to this historic property.
- The current railings are severely deteriorated. The applicant is purposing to use pressure treated wood that will match the existing materials and architectural details of the handrails and porch.
- The City's Historic Preservation Guide recommends repairing original materials when possible. If not possible, new elements should match the original as closely as possible. The proposed project is consistent with these recommendations.
- During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house was classified as a pivotal site to the College Park Historic District. A copy of the Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria.
- Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes *Specific Review Criteria* to be used in evaluating COA applications. The following criteria are relevant to this application: *Architectural Details*
 - The proposed materials are compatible with the character of this historic house.
- The proposed repairs satisfy the standards of Section 32.06(6)(c) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance.

Sustainability:

- **Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels** – The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures.
- **Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature** – N/A
- **Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems** – N/A
- **Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently** – N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Planning & Building Services Division recommends **approval** of a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the porch handrails for the property located at 726 Church Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall use the materials that were described and illustrated in the application and attachments. These repairs shall match the existing materials and architectural details of the current handrails and porch.
2. All work shall be completed by July 1, 2014.
3. Prior to beginning this project, the applicant's contractor shall obtain a Building Permit.
4. Any changes or additions to this Certificate of Appropriateness must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photos, Application, Cost Estimate, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.







CITY of BELOIT

PLANNING AND BUILDING SERVICES DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: 10A-2013-43

1. Address of property: 726 Church St.
2. Parcel #: 13670025.0.28 PLI; WPD .2850 acres
3. Owner of record: Beloit College Phone: 608-363-2200
726 Church St Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)
4. Applicant's Name: Beloit College
700 College St Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)
608-363-2200 / (Office Phone #) / (Cell Phone #) / physicalplant@beloit.edu (E-mail Address)

5. Present use of property: Office of Human Resources

6. The following action is requested:

- Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)
- Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)
- Roof repair/replacement
- Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles
- Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation
- Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)
- Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design
- Installation of fences
- Storm window/storm door repair or replacement
- Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

Beloit College is proposing replacement of the porch handrail at 726 Church St. This is due to the severe deterioration of the existing railing. The college is proposing the use of pressure treated wood to match existing materials and architectural details of the current railing. Does railing need to be raised building code height?

8. Attachments:

- Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
- Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
- Exterior photos
- Specifications (materials) for the project
- Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
- Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
- Cost estimates for all the proposed work
- Other (please explain): *Photos existing porch railing, historical photo*

9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:

- NHS City of Beloit SHSW Federal

NOTE:

The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).


Thomas Viel Thomas L. Viel 10/30/13
 (Signature of applicant) (Print name) (Date)

| |
|--|
| Review fee: \$50.00* / \$25.00* if staff approved Amount paid: \$ <u>50.00</u> * Review fees are doubled to \$100.00 and \$50.00 , respectively, when work begins prior to issuance of a COA. Scheduled meeting date: <u>11/21/13</u> Application accepted by: <u>STAFF</u> Date: <u>10/31/13</u> |
|--|

726 Church St. railing replacement materials

| | |
|----------------------|-----------------|
| Top rail/Bottom rail | \$110.43 |
| Spindles's | \$31.92 |
| Posts/caps | \$59.62 |
| Hardware | \$100.00 |
| <u>Paint</u> | <u>\$250.00</u> |
| Total | \$551.97 |

INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

| | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---------------------------------|---------------------|--|------|--------|
| City, Village or Town: 1 BELOIT | | County: ROCK | Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung | Date: July, 1981 | Street Church | | |
| Street Address: 726 Church Street | | Legal Description: Lot 4, Block 27, Original Plat | | Acreage: | | | |
| Current Name & Use: Residence | | Current Owner: Board of Trustees, Beloit College | | | Number 726 | | |
| Film Roll No. RO-86 *RO-111 |  | Current Owner's Address: 700 College Avenue, Beloit, Wisconsin | | | | | |
| Negative No. 2 *18, 19 | | Special Features Not Visible In Photographs: | | | | | |
| Facade Orient. E | Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No | | | | Town Range Section Map Name Map Code | | |
| Original Name & Use: 2 Anna Pratt House | | Source | Previous Owners | Dates | | Uses | Source |
| Dates of Construction/Alteration 1890 | | Source A | | | | | |
| Architect and/or Builder: | | Source | | | | | |
| 3 Architectural Significance <input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input checked="" type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input type="radio"/> None | | 4 Historical Significance <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with lives of significant persons <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with significant historical events <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with development of a locality <input type="radio"/> Other: _____ <input checked="" type="radio"/> None | | | Near East Side Historic District | | |
| Architectural Statement: This large residence, built in 1890, is an architecturally significant example of the Queen Anne style in Beloit. Rising two stories plus attic, the frame house has a complex roof line with hip and gabled elements. A series of rounded, square and chamfered bays project from the facade, while the cross gables are pedimented and feature heavy cornices. But the most remarkable feature of the house is the variegated siding. Smooth and narrow clapboarding wraps tightly around the first story while shingles in a reticulated pattern animate the upper stories with (over) | | Historical Statement: Mrs. Gertrude Pratt bought the property located at 726 Church from William Porter in 1889. The beautifully crafted house was built in the next year, 1890. Mrs. Pratt lived here until 1924, when she sold it to E. B. West of Illinois. (A) | | | | | |
| 5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above) A Beloit Tax Rolls, RCHS Archives B C D E F | | 6 Representation in Previous Surveys <input type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other: _____ | | | NES 86/2 | | |
| | | 7 Condition <input checked="" type="radio"/> excellent <input type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins | | | | | |
| | | 8 District: <u>Near East Side Historic Dist.</u> <input checked="" type="radio"/> pivotal <input type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: <u>R</u> date: <u>8/1/81</u> | | | NES 86/2 | | |
| | | 9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: <u>R</u> | | | | | |

726 Church Street
Architectural Statement (Continued)

movement and texture. The entry porch features heavy Eastlake-like porch posts and a perforated frieze, while Stick-like latticework ornaments the porch pediment and gables. Vergeboards, brackets, and a brick chimney rising through both stories and well above the roof ridge provide more variety to this Queen Anne home. The single most distinctive details are ogee shaped brackets on the front porch pillars; where the pillars are paired across the front these brackets meet to form a complete ogee arch.



CITY of BELOIT

Planning and Building Services Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 726 Church Street

| GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA | YES | NO | N/A |
|---|------------|-----------|------------|
| Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose? | | | X |
| Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible. | X | | |
| Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance? | X | | |
| Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right? | | | X |
| Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site? | X | | |
| Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities. | X | | |
| Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building? | | | X |
| Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project? | | | X |
| If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood? | | | X |
| Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired? | | | X |