

CITY OF BELOIT

REPORT TO THE BELOIT LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Meeting Date: December 2, 2014

Agenda Item: 5

File Number: COA-2014-48

Applicant: Jessica & Anthony Gonzales

Owner: Jessica & Anthony Gonzales

Location: 304 Bluff Street

Existing Zoning: R-1B, Single-Family

Existing Land Use: Duplex

Parcel Size: 0.1616 Acre

Request Overview/Background Information:

Jessica & Anthony Gonzales have submitted an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) to install new siding, windows, gutters, and storm doors at the property located at 304 Bluff Street.

Consistency with the Historic Preservation Ordinance and Strategic Plan:

Consideration of this request is consistent with the intent of the Ordinance and supports City of Beloit Strategic Goal #5.

Key Issues:

- The applicant has received funding under the Lead Hazard Control (LHC) Program, which is a forgivable loan project administered through the City of Beloit. With this, an inspection from the state Health Department is required. During this inspection, lead based paint was found on both the interior and exterior of the subject property.
 - Because of the requirements with both the Health Department and the LHC Program, lead based paint must be removed from this property to receiving the forgivable loan. Friction points like windows and doors must be replaced and wrapped to ensure no lead based paint can be released. Other exterior features have the option of encapsulation.
 - The applicant is requesting approval for new vinyl, double hung windows (required to receive funding). The existing windows are deteriorated- some wood, some vinyl. There is one stained-glass window on site. Staff is recommending that it be protected with storm windows and have the exterior trim wrapped versus replacement.
 - Gutters, downspouts, and storm doors have also been proposed. These will match the existing materials and colors.
 - The soffits, fascia, and exterior window trim throughout the property are proposed to be aluminum wrapped. Staff is recommending that all decorative sills, trims, and dentil accents be encapsulated and not wrapped.
 - The small front porch on the south side of the property will be replaced with pressure treated wood. The larger front porch on the north side may need replacement, depending on condition. This will also be with pressure treated wood. Wood railings will be replaced with new wood railing and painted. Decorative columns will be removed and new aluminum or vinyl decorative columns will be installed.
 - New vinyl siding has been proposed. Encapsulation is not a viable option for the siding of this property. Aside from cost, the existing wood siding is not in good enough condition to hold the encapsulation due to rotting. Because of this, the applicant is proposing vinyl siding.
 - During the Beloit Intensive Survey, the house was classified as a contributing structure within the Bluff Street Historic District. The Intensive Survey Form is attached to this report.
 - Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance includes general review criteria to be used when evaluating COA applications. The attached COA Checklist evaluates this application against the general review criteria included in the Ordinance. Planning staff believes that the proposed alterations comply with Section 32.06(6) of the Ordinance.
 - Section 32.06(5) of the Historic Preservation Ordinance establishes *Specific Review Criteria* to be used in evaluating COA applications. For this particular application, applicable review criteria include:
 - (1) *Proportions of Windows and Doors:* The proposed windows are proportional to the size and scale of the house and the existing window openings.
 - (2) *Architectural Details:* The proposed materials are not compatible with the original architectural style and character of this historic house, but lead abatement and full wood replacement for this project is cost prohibitive.
-

Sustainability:

- **Reduce dependence upon fossil fuels** – The preservation and enhancement of historic structures reduces dependence upon fossil fuels by capitalizing on the embodied energy that is present in these structures. Our historic districts are compact, walkable neighborhoods that were constructed when walking was a primary mode of travel.
- **Reduce dependence on chemicals and other manufacturing substances that accumulate in nature** – N/A
- **Reduce dependence on activities that harm life sustaining eco-systems** – N/A
- **Meet the hierarchy of present and future human needs fairly and efficiently** – N/A

Staff Recommendation:

The Planning & Building Services Division recommends approval of a COA to install new siding, windows, gutters, and storm doors at the property located at 304 Bluff Street, based on the standards and criteria contained in the Historic Preservation Ordinance and subject to the following conditions:

1. The applicant shall obtain a Building Permit before beginning any work.
2. Any stained glass and decorative windows on site must remain. They shall be protected by storm windows and the trim wrapped on the exterior.
3. All exterior decorative sills, trims, and dentil accents must be encapsulated and painted, not wrapped.
4. All work shall be completed by December 2, 2015.
5. Any changes or additions to this COA must be reviewed and approved by staff prior to the start of any work. Work done without prior approval will be subject to the issuance of correction orders or citations. The completion date above does not extend any other time limits, such as those imposed by an order from an Inspection Official.

Fiscal Note/Budget Impact: N/A

Attachments: Photos, Application, Intensive Survey Form, and COA Checklist.





10

CITY of BELOIT

PLANNING AND BUILDING SERVICES DIVISION

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION

(Please Type or Print)

File Number: COA-1014-48

- Address of property: 302 - 304 Bluff
- Parcel #: 13551055 R-1B - JULIETT
- Owner of record: _____ Phone: 608-201-5308
879 Petunia Ln Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)
- Applicant's Name: Jessica & Anthony Gonzales
879 Petunia Ln Beloit WI 53511
(Address) (City) (State) (Zip)
 (Office Phone #) 1 608-201-5308 (Cell Phone #) 1 jess.gonzales@live.com (E-mail Address)
- Present use of property: Rental

6. The following action is requested:

- Approval of COA by Landmarks Commission (projects not listed below)
- Approval of COA by staff: (Check all that apply)
 - Roof repair/replacement
 - Gutter repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials and in historically appropriate styles Aluminum 3x4 downspouts & K style gutters
 - Private sidewalk and driveway repair/replacement with historically appropriate materials in the same dimensions, placement and orientation
 - Installation of historic plaques (residential properties only)
 - Chimney repair and tuckpointing according to the Secretary of the Interior standards and in historically appropriate color and design
 - Installation of fences
 - Storm window/storm door repair or replacement - 2 pane 2 track storm doors - vinyl windows
 - Installation of glass blocks in basement window openings

- we are working with Kristy & Bob McDonald copy Bob on final COA.

Please continue to #7 (Over)

CERTIFICATE of APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATION (continued)

7. Description of Project: Describe each item of the project separately.

Project item: Include existing condition(s) when describing item. Also describe the proposed work, material(s) to be used, and the impact the item would have on existing historic or architectural features of the property. (Attach additional sheets if necessary.)

① Siding - right now the home exterior paint is chipping & flaking and our insurance & the city say it must be replaced. We would like it sided with vinyl siding because it will be maintenance free & look nice.
 - more on attached sheet

8. Attachments:

- Site Plan of the lot (Please indicate direction of north, dimensions, structures, etc.)
- Sketches, drawings, building and streetscape elevations, and/or annotated photos
- Exterior photos
- Specifications (materials) for the project
- Phased development plan for the project (if proposed in phases)
- Inspection report (required for demolition requests only)
- Cost estimates for all the proposed work
- Other (please explain): email from our insurance regarding need for exterior to be fixed

9. Source of Funds: Please indicate if funds for the project are being secured from any of the following sources:

- NHS
- City of Beloit
- SHSW
- Federal

NOTE:


The Beloit Landmarks Commission meets at 7:00 PM on the third Tuesday of the month. Meetings are held in The Forum of Beloit City Hall, 100 State Street. Applications must be filed with the Neighborhood Planning Division by the filing deadline date prior to the next Landmarks Commission meeting.

If you have questions or need assistance in completing this form, contact the City of Beloit Neighborhood Planning Division (364-6700).

Anthony Gonzalez (Signature of applicant) Anthony Gonzalez (Print name) 11/4/14 (Date)

Review fee: \$50.00* / \$25.00* if staff approved	Amount paid: \$ <u>50.00</u>
* Review fees are doubled to \$100.00 and \$50.00, respectively, when work begins prior to issuance of a COA.	
Scheduled meeting date: <u>12/12/2014</u>	
Application accepted by: <u>S. Hummel</u>	Date: <u>11/6/2014</u>

INTENSIVE SURVEY FORM Historic Preservation Division State Historical Society of Wisconsin

1 City, Village or Town: BELOIT		County: ROCK	Surveyor: Richard P. Hartung	Date: July, 1981	Bluff		
Street Address: 302-304 Bluff		Legal Description:		Acreage:			
Current Name & Use: residence (multiple)			Current Owner:		302-304		
Film Roll No. RO-113	 Contact Prints	Current Owner's Address:		Interior visited? <input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No			
Negative No. 22		Special Features Not Visible In Photographs:					
Facade Orient. E							
2 Original Name & Use:		Source	Previous Owners	Dates	Uses	Source	Town
Dates of Construction /Alteration c. 1885		Source A					
Architect and/or Builder:		Source					
3 Architectural Significance <input type="radio"/> Represents work of a master <input type="radio"/> Possesses high artistic values <input type="radio"/> Represents a type, period, or method of construction <input type="radio"/> Is a visual landmark in the area <input checked="" type="radio"/> Other: None			4 Historical Significance <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with lives of significant persons <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with significant historical events <input type="radio"/> Assoc. with development of a locality <input type="radio"/> Other: <input checked="" type="radio"/> None				Section
Architectural Statement: A vernacular rendition of the local Stick style, this frame house is sided with narrowly gauged clapboards while largely devoid of ornament. Multiple, intersecting gables create an irregular and angular profile and a shed roof extends over the entry porch. Simple architrave trim frames the windows and turned posts support the porch.			Historical Statement:				
5 Sources of Information (Reference to Above) A Visual estimate of surveyor			6 Representation in Previous Surveys <input type="radio"/> HABS <input type="radio"/> NAER <input checked="" type="radio"/> WIHP <input type="radio"/> NRHP <input type="radio"/> landmark <input type="radio"/> other:				Bluff Street Historic District
B			7 Condition <input type="radio"/> excellent <input checked="" type="radio"/> good <input type="radio"/> fair <input type="radio"/> poor <input type="radio"/> ruins				
C			8 District: Bluff Street Historic District <input type="radio"/> pivotal <input checked="" type="radio"/> contributing <input type="radio"/> non-contributing initials: RW date: 8/1/81				
D			9 Opinion of National Register Eligibility <input checked="" type="radio"/> eligible <input type="radio"/> not eligible <input type="radio"/> unknown <input type="radio"/> national <input type="radio"/> state <input type="radio"/> local initials: RW				
E							
F							
Map Code BS 113/22							

CITY of BELOIT

Planning and Building Services Division

100 State Street, Beloit, WI 53511

Phone: (608) 364-6700

Fax: (608) 364-6609

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS CHECKLIST

For property located at: 304 Bluff Street

GENERAL REVIEW CRITERIA	YES	NO	N/A
Has every reasonable effort been made to provide a compatible use for a property that requires alteration for use other than for its originally intended purpose?			X
Will the applicant retain distinguishing original qualities or character of a building, structure or site? The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural features should be avoided when possible.	X		
Is the applicant proposing alterations that have a historical basis, rather than trying to create an earlier or later appearance?		X	
Has the applicant recognized and respected changes in the development of a building over time that may have acquired significance in their own right?			X
Has the applicant treated with sensitivity distinctive stylistic features, or examples of skilled craftsmanship that characterize a building, structure or site?	X		
Has the applicant repaired, rather than replaced, deteriorated architectural features, wherever possible? If replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design color, texture and other visual qualities.		X	
Has the applicant avoided sandblasting and other cleaning methods that will damage the surface of the historic building?			X
Has the applicant made every possible effort to protect and preserve archeological resources affected by or adjacent to any project?			X
If a contemporary design for alterations and additions is proposed, does this design retain significant historical, architectural or cultural material and is the design compatible with the size, scale, color, material and character of the property and neighborhood?	X		
Are new additions or alterations to buildings done in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired?			X